5-17-1947

An Evaluation of the Nineteeth Century English Hymn Tune for American Lutheran Worship

Elmer N. Witt
Concordia Seminary, St. Louis, ir_witte@csl.edu

AN EVALUATION OF THE NINETEENTH CENTURY ENGLISH HYMN TUNE FOR AMERICAN LUTHERAN WORSHIP

A Thesis Presented to
The Faculty of Concordia Seminary
Department of Practical Theology

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Bachelor of Divinity

---

by
Elmer N. Witt
May 1947

Approved by: W. G. Polack

Richard P. Caemmerer

"Sing to the Lord a new song; sing to the Lord all the earth! For God has made our heart and spirit joyful through his dear Son, whom he offered for us to redeem us from sin, death, and devil. He who earnestly believes this cannot keep quiet about it; he must sing about it joyfully and exult over it and speak about it so that others also hear and come to it.....Therefore, the printers are doing a very commendable work when they print good hymns industriously and make them attractive to the people with all manner of ornamentation, to the end that they may be incited to this joy in believing and gladly sing."

---Dr. Martin Luther

TABLE OF CONTENTS

AN EVALUATION OF THE NINETEENTH CENTURY ENGLISH HYMN TUNE FOR AMERICAN LUTHERAN WORSHIP

I. THE HYMN AND HYMN TUNE IN LUTHERAN WORSHIP

Since the earliest days of the Christian Church, believers everywhere have recognized the God-given requisite for common worship. "The assembling of ourselves together"[1] inevitably became organized. Many of the early Christians were converts from the liturgical Jewish religion and brought with them a feeling for systematized worship. From the beginning an integral part of this system was the use of "psalms and hymns and spiritual songs,"[2] as a means for letting the Word of Christ dwell richly in Christian hearts. History has shown how hymn-singing eventually fell into disuse with the rise of clericalism in the Eastern and Western Church. The priest and the specially trained choir became the only vocal participants in worship. History has also shown that Martin Luther and the Protestant Reformation brought back congregational singing in the communal worship.

---

1. Hebrews 10: 25.
2. Colossians 3: 16.

The Lutheran Church has upheld Dr. Luther's emphasis on the singing of hymns, and for centuries has been known as "the Singing Church."

We do well, therefore, to study the hymns and the hymn tunes that are used in our common Lutheran worship and to evaluate them in the light of objective criteria. In this paper we shall limit our study to the music written for the hymns, and that from a specific period and area of Christian Worship.

For many decades the Lutheran Church followed the example of the Reformer and continued to produce hymn tunes for public worship of musical worth. This was the era of the Lutheran Chorale. Gradually this output ceased in the land of the Reformation and was undoubtedly expected to be caught up by those church groups which bear Luther's name in other parts of the world. This expectation has not been realized. Except perhaps for a few worth-while tunes from the Scandinavian Lutherans and a few translations and revisions of the German chorales, the Lutheran Church outside of Germany has not been conspicuous in the field of hymnody and hymn tune writing.

Yet the Lutheran hymnals continue to increase in size and in choice of hymn tunes. A brief study of The Lutheran Hymnal (1941) of the Missouri Synod shows that the composers of the 380 tunes of the hymnal come in the main from three countries: 18 from America, 59 from England, and 58

from Germany.[3] This trend is borne out in the other Lutheran hymnals published in America during the first 40 years of this century, to perhaps an even more marked degree. If so many of these tunes are coming into the Lutheran Services from extra-Lutheran sources, we also do well to study these sources with the aim of evaluating their usage in the Lutheran Church of America.

In this paper we shall study the contribution of the Anglican Church.

> For nearly four centuries the Anglican Church has supplied English-speaking Christendom with its best tunes, tunes that are universally conceded to be models of their type. Their only rivals are the Lutheran Chorales, but Lutheran Hymnody is a thing of the past while the Anglican Church is today at its fullest and ripest period of musical expression. 4

We shall further limit the scope of the paper by narrowing the study to a comparatively new type of hymn tune that arose during the nineteenth century. Dean Lutkin outlines the period:

> The nineteenth century witnessed the birth of a new type of hymn tune in England and one which largely dominates the hymn tune composer of today. The leading exponents of this style of Anglican hymn tunes are Goss, 1800; Smart, 1813; Elvey, 1816; Hopkins, 1818; Monk, 1823; Dykes, 1823; Barnby, 1834; Stainer, 1840; and, Sullivan, 1842. 5

Edmund S. Lorenz emphasizes the importance of the his-

---

3. W. G. Polack, The Handbook to the Lutheran Hymnal, p. XII.
4. Peter Christian Lutkin, Music in the Church, p. 3.
5. Peter Christian Lutkin, Selected Hymns and Carols, Foreword.

torical approach to Church Music in his book designed to stimulate the interests of the ministers, especially of the non-liturgic denominations in this vast field of music. Why, he asks, should the preacher be interested only in the development of doctrine and not in the development of music which also plays an important part of every public worship? Why is Palestrina not as interesting as Savonarola?[6]

To enter a discussion of the music of Christian hymnody we must have before us an adequate definition of the hymn itself. "A hymn is a sacred poem expressive of devotion, spiritual experience, or religious truth, fitted to be sung by an assembly of people."[7] Furthermore, a hymn "must be true, Biblical, Christian, edifying, simple yet dignified in language, excellent in content and form, devotional in tone, churchly and congregational in viewpoint and sentiment."[8] We are careful to avoid any confusion be-

---

6. Edmund S. Lorenz, Church Music, pp. 37-38: "If the minister has not followed the development of the American hymn tune from William Billings down to the present time, if he does not know the extraordinary influence of Lowell Mason upon American church music, or the progress of the English hymn tune from Tallis down to Dykes, how can he judge as to their relative claims upon American churches?"

Edward Dickinson, Music in the History of the Western Church, p. 406: "Both ministers and choir leaders should be aware of the nature of the problems which ecclesiastical music presents. They should know something of the experience of the church in its historic dealings with this question, of the special qualities of the chief forms of church song which have so greatly figured in the past, and of the nature of the affect of music upon the mind both by itself alone

tween the discussion at hand and a discussion of spiritual songs in general, or between the hymn and the gospel-song. We are here interested solely in the true church-hymn. The definition given above also governs the tunes to which the hymns are set, for words and tune work together for a common effect and goal in public worship.

Furthermore, since we are to evaluate hymn tunes for use in American Lutheran worship, we must also have before us an adequate concept of the special demands of the Lutheran religious service. Such demands are Biblical and traditional, and a clear outline of these gives us the needed objective criteria for judgment of the Anglican hymn tune.

First, we shall consider the Biblical or doctrinal demands of Lutheran worship. The Lutheran faith is built solely on the Atonement of Jesus Christ. The people that gather for corporate worship are in the main believers in this Atonement. Through this work of reconciliation, Jesus Christ has brought them back into fellowship with their Father, and through Jesus Christ they worship Him. The moods, therefore, of Lutheran worship are always moods of joy, joy in the Atonement of Christ. Lutheran worship, furthermore, is always an expression of the believer's strong faith in the Atoning Christ; it is always built around the Word which

---

and in collusion with other religious influences."

7. Harvey B. Marks, quoted by Polack, op. cit., p. IX.
8. Ibid.

brings the message of this reconciliation. Luther writes:

> .....it is necessary to know, first of all, that the Christian congregation never should assemble unless God's Word is preached and prayer is made, no matter for how brief a time this may be. 9

Finally, Lutheran worship is always the worship of the corporate church. The believers gather for worship, and together they are instructed of God, and together they bring their common problems and praise before His throne.

The second consideration is how these doctrinal principles of worship have been put into practice. Traditionally, Lutheran worship has always included the hymn by the people. Since the people have gathered for worship, since they have individually been redeemed by the Atoning Christ, and since they each are members of the royal priesthood, Luther and his followers have demanded a place for the congregational hymn in public worship.

> .....let me emphasize that we must regard the great musical heritage of the Lutheran Church not only as a precious gift of God, but also as a manifestation of Lutheranism's belief in the doctrine of the universal priesthood. This precious doctrine has exerted a tremendous influence in determining the nature of our Lutheran liturgies and the styles, character, spirit, and content of Lutheran church music. 10

---

9. Martin Luther, "Concerning the Ordering of Divine Worship in the Congregation," Works of Martin Luther, VI, p. 60.

10. Walter E. Buszin, "The Doctrine of the Universal Priesthood and Its Influence Upon the Liturgies and Music of the Lutheran Church," Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, The Musical Heritage of the Church, p. 127.

Furthermore, the hymn tune of traditional Lutheran worship has always been in the idiom close to popular capacity. This is witnessed by the sources of the Lutheran chorales. The first was Gregorian music accomodated to the limitations of the people. It was simplified and even changed to bring it within popular reach. Secondly, the religious folk songs of the people in days prior to the Reformation became a source for the Lutheran chorales, again music in the popular idiom. The third source was the hymns of the Bohemian Brethren and later, hymns from the Huguenot Psalter. These, too, were simple tunes the common people loved. Finally, the original hymns penned within Lutheran circles by Luther and others were the fourth source.[11] Although the Reformer and his associates in no way ignored the artistic in church music, the hymns they produced were popular hymns. They were hymns that could and would be sung by the people.

In addition to the hymn of the people, Lutheran worship is traditionally associated with the organ. The hymn is sung with organ accompaniment. The Lutheran chorale and organ music effected mutual influences.

> .....the German Reformation had brought in the new Lutheran chorales which the people sang with unfailing gusto and enthusiasm. Organists were not slow to take advantage of this interest in the chorales and introduced them with preliminary passages, based on the tune to be sung. 12

These "preludes" developed into short organ movements and be-

11. Ibid., pp. 117-121.
12. Lorenz, op. cit., p. 426.

came very popular with German church composers and had a definite influence on later organ music. On the other hand, the hymn tunes of the church came from the pens of church organists to a great degree and were conditioned by the organ training of these composers.

The evaluation of hymn tunes for Lutheran worship, then, must rest on these doctrinal and traditional considerations. They must be in the spirit and faith of the Atonement of Christ Jesus and within the musical capacity of the people that sing them.

II. A BRIEF HISTORY OF ENGLISH CHURCH MUSIC UP TO THE NINETEENTH CENTURY

In order to understand the music of the latter half of the 19th century in England, the reader must have an overview of the entire history of English Church Music. The musical concepts of the men who wrote the hymn tunes we are to evaluate were the results of the long chain of development in the church music of England. When Augustine and his monks entered Canterbury in the year 596, they brought with them not only the Roman hierarchy and sovereignty, but also the system of church music of their pope, Gregory the Great. Although the Gregorian system easily found its way into the urban churches, the people's own songs, secular and religious, held out in the villages and rural areas. The roots of English music are to be found in the folk songs and folk dances which developed side by side with the ecclesiastical art fostered by Gregory's monks. However, instead of the comparatively highly developed Gregorian system "raising" the musical taste of the English peasants, their popular ballad tunes found their ways into the church.[1] In the great monastic centers the pure Gregorian melodies did manage to survive, and for about 900 years these two elements, Gregorian and folk songs, continued to strive for ascendancy,

---

1. Lorenz, op. cit., p. 270: "Not only did the Church use the people's melodies for its own purposes outside of the church service, but they were adapted to the needs of the church service itself."

the folk tune slowly gaining the day. The English madrigal and glee of later times are similar, in origin at least, to these earlier, somewhat cruder ballads of the common people.[2]

The chief blow to the pure Gregorian influence remained for the hands of the self-willed Henry VIII. In his endeavor to centralize England's rule, he suppressed the monasteries and at the same time stamped out the pure plainsong of Gregory. However, the ancient plainsong was adapted to the vernacular, and the first part of the English service arranged in this way was translated by Archbishop Cranmer in 1544. Although Henry's reformation was at first anti-papal, rather than anti-Catholic, the high religious feelings of the continent could not be warded off long. The religious folk-songs and metrical psalms of the Lollards, Wycliffites, and Calvinists soon found their way to the ears of the English people and began the inter-English struggle of church music which was felt even in the days of America's Pilgrim fathers.

---

2. Several references will be made to the madrigal and glee in chapter III. The madrigal is a secular composition for two or more voices, practised originally in North Italy in the 14th century and revived in the 16th and 17th centuries, when it became popular in most of Europe. The glee is derived from the Anglo-Saxon gligge, which means music. It is defined as a piece of unaccompanied vocal music in at least three parts, and for solo voices, usually those of men. Glees came into use around the beginning of the 18th century and reached the peak of their popularity between 1750 and 1825. Cf. Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, s. v., III, p. 275, II, p. 392.

> Nowhere has music been a keener two-edged sword, a fiercer weapon, than in England during the fifteenth, sixteenth, and seventeenth centuries..... Gregorian chant (in the vernacular) was arrayed against folk-song styles; polyphonic choral literature versus a new style of composition, the anthem; Psalmody striking at the heart of original hymns. 3

Within the newly established English Church, the contrapuntal style developed, endeavoring to give each voice equal importance. This movement was a result of the general rise of medieval polyphonic music in the 16th century. Palestrina had brought on the Golden Age of Roman Church Music and with it the upsurge of contrapuntal style. The movement caught on outside of Italy and spread throughout Europe to England, where it found forceful adherents in Tallis and Byrd. These two men, with Tye and Gibbons were in the fore in the writing of motets during this period, following the pattern of Palestrina, Orlando di Lasso, Willaert, and others. They soon turned their efforts from the Latin motet, however, to the writing of anthems with English texts and found a new inspiration in the fresher rhythms and accentuation of the new texts.[4] Tallis gained the title of "Father of English Cathedral Music," but carried over his interest in the polyphonic style to his organ works and psalm tunes. Most of his work was done while he was at the Abbey of the Holy Cross at Waltham in Essex and later when he served as joint organist with Byrd at the Chapel Royal. Gibbons also helped to build the polyphonic influence on

---

3. H. Augustine Smith, "The Expression of Religion in Music," The Arts and Religion, A. E. Bailey, p. 120.
4. Lorenz, op. cit., p. 359.

English Church Music. For over twenty years he served as organist at the Chapel Royal. He wrote no music for the Latin Church rites and few of his compositions for English texts were published during his lifetime. His own importance, and the influence of the polyphonic style for which he stood, is evidenced by a collection of his church music published by Sir Frederick Ouseley in 1873, in the midst of the period under discussion.

But the Puritans and non-conformists, beginning with the reign of Elizabeth, asked for stricter Calvinistic doctrine, Presbyterianism in the stead of the Episcopacy, and a "purer" form of worship than the Anglican. "The supposed simplicity of the apostolic practice was assumed to be a constraining law upon all later generations."[8] During the next two centuries, while John Blow (1648-1708), Henry Purcell (1658-1695), and William Croft (1677-1727) carried on and advanced the English Cathedral music, the voices of the Puritans and Independents cried for the purity of Calvin's metrical psalms and bewailed the "Papal" use of the motet and anthem.

> The extraordinary personal ascendancy of Calvin was shown.....also in the fact that his opinions concerning the ideal method of public worship were treated with almost equal reverence (as his theological system), and in many localities have held sway to the present time. Conscious, perhaps to excess, of certain harmful tendencies in ritualism, he proclaimed that everything formal

---

8. Dickinson, op. cit., p. 363.

> and artistic in worship was an offense to God; he clung to this belief with characteristic tenacity and enforced it upon all the congregations under his rule.....The unemotional unison tunes to which these rhymed psalms were set also satisfied the stern demands of those rigid zealots, who looked upon every appeal to the aesthetic sensibility in worship as an enticement to compromise with popery. 9

We must be slow to condemn these metrical psalms and their musical settings. They were not merely the product of anti-Roman hatred coming from a group of Stoic-like enthusiasts. Indeed, they were a product of the Calvinistic conception of Christianity with its emphasis on the sovereign will of the absolute God, in contrast to the Lutheran approach to common worship centering in the work of the Atoning Christ. However, we must search the conditions and times of these people. We must take into consideration the fierce persecution to which they were subjected and the natural antipathy they would have toward everything associated with their "enemies."

> "The metrical psalms," says Curwen (Studies in Worship Music), "were Protestant in their origin, and in their use they exemplified the Protestant principle of allowing every worshiper to understand and participate in the service. As years went on.....They were a liturgy to those who rejected liturgies." It was their one outlet of poetic religious feeling, and dry and prosaid as both words and music seem to us now, we must believe, since human nature is everywhere moved by much the same impulses, that these psalms and tunes were not to those who used them barren and formal things, and that in the singing of them there was an undercurrent of rapture which to our minds it seems almost impossible that they could produce. 10

---

9. Ibid., pp. 358-363.
10. Ibid., p. 377.

Therefore, during the time that the great Mr. Handel thrilled the English people with his oratorios and gave further impetus to English Cathedral Music, the Non-conformists published Psalter after Psalter, based in one way or the other on the excellent work of Thomas Sternhold and the Rev. John Hopkins which appeared in 1563.

But we must not overemphasize the strife between the composers of Cathedral music, on the one hand, and the writers of psalm tunes, on the other. The musicians of the established church previously mentioned wrote many psalm tunes also, a number of which have come down to the hymnals of our day. Examples are: St. Anne and Hanover from William Croft; Tallis' Canon from Thomas Tallis; and Light Divine from Orlando Gibbons. These bring us the basic characteristics of the English Psalm tune: a. syllabic, a note to every syllable; b. plain and severe rhythm, only common time being used; c. radical change of chord with every note of the melody; d. distinctly contrapuntal harmony; and, e. melodic structure that was simple but symmetrical.[11]

However, the contributions of these men soon turned to naught. As the psalter by Sternhold and Hopkins was introduced widely, the text and tunes became a sacred tradition. The people did not want new tunes. Confusion and disorder filled the land because of the contest between the Puritans

---

11. Lorenz, op. cit., p. 277.

and Cavaliers. Books became scarce and those that did exist did not contain the tunes. Hence came the "lining out" of hymns, that is, a leader read or sang each line before it was sung. In the 18th century, the psalmody of the Presbyterians, Independents, and Separatists, declined into the most contracted and unemotional routine that can be found in the history of religious song. The number of tunes grow less and less, in some congregations being reduced to a bare half-dozen. The conception of individualism, which was the source of congregational singing, in the first place, was carried to such absurd extremes that the notion extensively prevailed that every person was privileged to sing the melody in any key or tempo and with any grotesque embellishment that might be pleasant to himself.[12]

We must here take note of a by-product of the Non-conformists' view on public worship. Their Protestant principle of the laity participating in common worship found its way into the Established Church. Under the Article entitled "Anglican Parish Church," in The Oxford Companion to Music,[13]

---

12. Dickinson, op. cit., p. 378.

13. The Oxford History of Music, VI, p. 33: "The 'clerks' (lay or in minor orders) who had formerly, in the chancel, assisted the priest in the responsive parts of the service, now (perhaps in some places gradually) became reduced to one 'parish clerk' upon whom devolved the leading of the people's verses of the (read) prose psalms and the responses, which latter may in some places have been chanted to the new adaptation of the old plainsong and in others merely uttered in a speaking voice. A metrical psalm was often also included in the service, as what we today would call a hymn, and this was announced, read, and led by the parish clerk, sitting at his desk."

we find that the Reformation eventually affected the liturgy of the established church. At first the influence was bold, but later the lay-participation was molded into the traditional principles of "high-church" worship.

In considering the development of the music of the English during these years, we cannot overlook the contribution of George Frederick Handel. He first came to England from Germany in 1710 and stayed but six months. However, he returned in 1712, overstayed his leave, and when his own master, King George, came to the English throne, Handel stayed on, until his death in 1759. At the time of his coming, English music was under the influence of the Italian opera which had so greatly influenced Handel himself. His oratorios soon molded the tastes of the English people, but we must note that Handel's oratorios were "concert oratorios." His works differed strikingly from the earlier works, his own and those of Schuetz, Keiser, Bach, and Telemann, in Germany.[14] His influence, therefore, was not directly felt in the psalm tune writing of his day or the later hymn tune writing. The effect

---

14. Ibid., s. v., "Oratorio;" ".....the outstanding difference between the Handel oratorio and the various German works of the preceding and contemporary period, such as the Schuetz Resurrection and Passions and the Bach Passions. These latter are definitely devotional works. They have a thread of narrative, with the dramatic element entering in the dialogue of the various passages, and meditation in the shape of reflective arias and chorales. Handel's oratorios are not primarily devotional, but either dramatic or epic.. ...but they are essentially English."

of his work in England was shown, however, in the Cathedral Music that followed. Although his oratorios influenced the anthem in a positive way, in general Handel's influence was unfavorable. Cathedral music flourished, but "the standard of achievement sank lower and lower"[15] and the flowery melodies became an end in themselves. We note further that during this period, the organ is almost unknown, or at least generally not used, in the worship of the church.

The writing of congregational songs revived under new impulses. The Puritan and Non-conformist influences began to diminish, although they did not disappear by any means. The road was slowly paved for the hymn tune to succeed the psalm tune. As the church and people began to condone the expression of religious thought and sentiments in extra-Biblical words, largely through the work of Isaac Watts, the father of English Hymnody, the musicians began to feel the need for new and freer settings for these hymns. While this hymnological movement was not Methodistic in origin, the Wesleyan initiative in regard to the music is undeniable. The evangelistic work of the Wesleys called for something more than mere devotional music. "The effort to win the unsaved in popular meetings, large and small, made attractive, spirited, exciting singing extremely important."[16] Their

---

15. Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, IV. p. 728.
16. Lorenz, op. cit., p. 283.

new hymns that emphasized personal experience demanded emotional tunes. Hence, the Wesleys encouraged the composers of their day to write the type of music they needed. Dickinson summarizes the influence of the Wesleys:

> Whatever effect of the exuberant singing of the Methodist assemblies may have had upon a cultivated ear, it is certain that the enthusiastic welcome accorded by the Wesleys to popular music as a proselyting agent, and the lattitude permitted to a free invention and adoption of hymns and tunes, gave an impulse to purer and nobler style of congregation song which has never been lost.....The example of the Methodists was a revelation of the power that lies in popular song when inspired by conviction, and was said of the early Lutheran chorale, so it might be said of the Methodist hymns, that they won more souls than even the preaching of the evangelists. 17

This exuberant singing was not without its bad effects. As in almost every phase of historical narrative, the pendulum swung to the other extreme. Instead of a congregation limiting itself to six or so tunes, the English churches were swamped with tunes. Almost everyone that occupied the organist's bench on Sunday morning felt himself duty bound to turn out at least a few hymn tunes every year. The results could not help but be disastrous to the musical standards. These musical expressions of emotion became more and more flowery until they gave to the whole tendency the name of the "Florid School." Inevitably the tunes fell into disrepute both with the Anglicans and Non-conformists who held to

---

17. Dickinson, op. cit., pp. 378-379.

the stateliness of the syllabic tunes.

> Many of these new tunes deserve the criticism which they met, being secular, complicated and impracticable, but the whole movement was a very valuable one, breaking down the mechanical rigidity that had already wrecked the musical efficiency of the churches of England. 18

This school is described as the "introduction of a new and frivolous spirit into English hymn tunes, which gradually spread throughout the 18th century, and had disastrous results."[19] Secular music was adapted to sacred words, repetitions were multiplied and "vocal exercises more suitable to the Italian opera of the day were introduced for the honour and glory of the singers."[20] This low standard of music was not entirely evil, however, for by reaction it led to a spirit of experiment which brought in the better tunes of the 19th century.[21]

This brings our survey to the beginning of the 19th century and to the point of change in the attitudes and concepts of church music, and more specifically, of hymn tune writing.

---

18. Lorenz, op. cit., p. 285.
19. Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, II, p. 694.
20. Ibid., p. 695.
21. Dickinson, op. cit., pp. 382-383: "Thus the diatonic school was succeeded in the eighteenth century by a taste for the florid and ornate which, in spite of some contributions of a very beautiful and expressive character, on the whole marked a decline in favor of the tawdry and sensational. If this tendency was an indication of an experimental spirit, its result was not altogether evil. Earnest and dignified as the old psalm-tunes were, the church could not live by them alone. The lighter style was a transition, and the purer modern school is the outcome of a process which thrives to unite the breadth and dignity of the ancient tunes with the warmth and color of those of the second period."

We are about to approach the ascendancy in church music, and this ascendancy can be traced to the influence outlined in this chapter, skillfully guided by the leaders of the 100 years that followed. Plainsong, counterpoint, the Psalm tune, Handel, Cathedral Music, the Methodist and Congregational hymns, and the Florid school contributed to the setting of the early nineteenth century and of the rise of English hymn tune writing.

III. ASCENDANCY OF ENGLISH CHURCH MUSIC IN THE NINETEENTH CENTURY

We have stated that the musical concepts of the hymn tune writers of the nineteenth century were the results of the long chain of development in English Church Music. These men and their musical principles were also products of their own age. The musical leaders that trained these men and the centers of interest in church music aided in making these church musicians the leaders in later years. Before discussing the biographical material of these hymn tune writers, we will note some of these contemporary influences.

The first to be considered is the Chapel Royal, a body of clergy and musicians attached to the household of the royal family. Records of this religious establishment in England go back to 1135. The duty of the group was to perform daily services wherever the king was in residence whether he attended in person or not. Because this establishment, under patronage, usually set the pattern for the church music of the times, membership in the group was a coveted distinction. In the period of the Restoration we find Blow, Purcell, and Croft as leaders of the Chapel. It reached its greatest glory in Elizabethan times, when Byrd, Tallis, Gibbons, and others served the Queen here. Today the Chapel Royal consists of a body of clergymen, choirmen and boys, and the organist is charged with the conduct of the Sunday services, chiefly in the St. James Palace. "No one institution has been more

useful in fostering English musicianship and promoting the development of English music."[1]

Many of the leaders of this period began their musical education as "choristers," a technical term for a boy singer in Cathedral or church choirs. This is an ecclesiastical office of ancient origin. The oldest in England is St. Paul's Cathedral, which dates from the time of Edward the Confessor. Usually only 10 or 15 boys were in attendance at a particular school at one time. The purpose of the institution was to train the boys both in singing and in grammar, but especially to provide choral music for the services. Early in the nineteenth century cathedral choristers were pitifully neglected by the heads of the church. Treatment given these young boys often became brutal. Miss Maria Hackett devoted her time and money to bettering the condition of choristers in all parts of England. Before her death in 1874 she was able to see fruits of her efforts in the improvements that came in many of the churches and cathedrals.[2]

Although of contemporary origin, the Royal Academy of Music (R.A.M.) also played an important role in the development of music and musicians of this time. The institution was proposed by a group of noblemen in 1822. The king was as the principal patron and the government of the Academy con-

---

1. The Oxford History of Music, s. v., "Chapel Royal," p. 156. Cf. Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, I, s. v., "Chapel Royal," pp. 607 ff.
2. Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, I, s. v. "chorister," pp. 641-642.

sisted of a committee of twenty-five directors. The school was to be supported by subscriptions and donations. There was also a board of four professors and a principal and a number of associate professors. The first principal was Dr. William Crotch, and Sir George Smart and Henry Smart served as professors in the opening year, 1823. The students were to be between the ages of 10 and 15, and the total enrollment was limited to forty girls and forty boys. The institution is in existence today, supported partially by government grant, and offers between 60 and 70 scholarships for study in every branch of music.[3]

Through these three influences, we can see the prominence of the church organ. In the Royal Academy, and more especially in the Royal Chapel and in the parish choirs, the musicians were trained at the organ. Improvements in the instrument itself,[4] and the work of Samuel Wesley (1766-1837), a powerful extempore player, helped restore English organ music to its former solid basis.[5] His son, Samuel Sebastian Wesley, also became a prominent organist of the 19th century. We will note that almost without exception, the hymn tune writers of this period spent some time as organists in the churches and cathedrals, especially in the London area.

---

3. Cf. Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, IV, s. v., "Royal Academy of Music," pp. 457-460.
4. The Oxford History of Music, s. v., "Organ," pp. 656 ff.
5. Lorenz, op. cit., p. 435.

One of the first musical leaders of the century was Thomas Atwood, followed by his god-son, Thomas Atwood Walmisley. The latter assumes a more important role later as the instructor and professor of some of the leading hymn tune writers of the period. Samuel Sebastian Wesley carried on the heritage left by his father and gained new honors through his mastery of the organ and ability in the composition of Cathedral Music. Thus English church music began to be revived from its lethargy. Soon followed the work of Sir John Goss, and we have reached the era of the new hymn tune.[6] Some attribute the change in hymn tune writing to the work of the American composer of hymn and song, Lowell Mason. However this cannot be verified from the other sources listed in this paper. The Oxford History of Music give more credit to the German master, Bach, than to any American source. Around the middle of the century William Sterndale Bennett, one of the most brilliant of the early pupils of the Royal Academy of Music, turned his mind to the idea of making his countrymen sing Bach. He and a few friends founded a "Bach Society." Other musicians cooperated and a great movement was started. But the importance of the Bach movement to English music is not merely the introduction once again of the best of continental art to this country. Rather it was that Bach roused the English ama-

---

6. David R. Breed, History and Use of Hymns and Hymn Tunes, p. 308.

teurs from their lethargy, and set them new tasks of varying magnitude. Bach's music called for the highest efforts of all classes, from the Leeds Festival Choirs...to a village choir compassing with difficulty a four-part chorale. It...opened the minds of English choralists to a myriad of musical forms great and small.[7]

In time the impact was felt by the hymn tune writers and the modern tune evolved. The modern English tunes include all those written since 1800. Dickinson describes the Period in this way:

> In comparatively recent times a new phase of progress has manifested itself in the presence in the later hymnals of a large number of musical compositions of novel form and coloring, entirely the product of our own period.....Composed for the noble ceremony of the Anglican Church, these tunes have made their way into many of the non-liturgic sects, and the value of their influence in inspiring love for that which is purest and most salutary in worship has been incalculable. 8

The most noteworthy publication of this period is, Hymns Ancient and Modern, with text edited by Sir Henry W. Baker and produced under the musical editorship of William Henry Monk. A few interested clergymen and musicians had taken it upon themselves to put out a "hymnal to end all hymnals," a task not to be belittled in the light of the many collections of hymns good and bad that found their way into the English churches and homes in the latter part of this cen-

---

7. The Oxford History of Music, VI, p. 455.
8. Dickinson, op. cit., pp. 383-384.

tury. After many conferences and much arduous labor, Hymns Ancient and Modern, "For use in the Services of the Church, with Accompanying Tunes," was printed in 1861.

Dykes' tunes, with Monk's own rich contributions and those of Elvey, Gauntlett, Redhead, Reinagle and others, with Monk's choice and arrangement of ancient melodies and psalm tunes, crystallized the musical tendencies of the time into a definite form of Anglican hymn tune, with restrained melodies and close harmonies wonderfully adapted to liturgical worship, and yet appealing to the taste of the people. These tunes constituted the immediate appeal of the book[9] not only within but beyond the bounds of the Church. Since, then, this hymnal of the Anglican Communion represents the crystallization of the tendencies in hymn tune writing of the period, we shall devote ourselves to a brief study of the lives of several of the musicians who contributed new tunes to it. The order will be chronological, beginning with Sir John Goss at the turn of the century.

Sir John Goss was born in Fareham, Hants, on December 27, 1800, the son of Joseph Goss, organist af Fareham. At the age of ten he became one of the children of the Chapel Royal under John Stafford Smith, and on leaving the choir became a pupil of Thomas Attwood, under whom he completed

---

9. Louis F. Benson, The English Hymn, p. 521.

his musical education. His ability as a singer is witnessed by his appearance as a tenor of the chorus at the first production of "Don Giovanni" in English in 1817.

> The fact of his being a singer made him mindful of the needs of vocalists, and nothing that he ever wrote was not laid out to display the best powers of the voice for which it is set. 10

In 1819 Goss unsuccessfully competed (a practice common to the day) for the position of organist of Chelsea Church, but was appointed such at Stockwell Chapel two years later. From 1824 until 1838 he served as organist in the parish church of St. Luke, Chelsea, at the same time devoting a good deal of his efforts to teaching, both privately and as professor of Harmony at the Royal Academy. Here he also showed a great interest in glee singing and wrote a set of glees and a madrigal. Also while at St. Luke's, Goss published a collection of parochial psalmody, including organ voluntaries, chants, and hymn tunes. His orchestral writing done during this period did not find too much success. In 1833 he won the coveted Gresham Prize Medal for his anthem, "Have Mercy upon Me."

Upon the death of his former instructor, Attwood, in March of 1838, Goss became his successor as organist and vicar choral of St. Paul's Cathedral. In 1841 he compiled and published a collection of chants, entitled, Chants Ancient and Modern, contributing eleven himself.[11] From about the

---

10. John S. Bumpus, A History of English Cathedral Music, second series, p. 504.
11. Ibid., p. 511.

middle of the century on, hardly a year passed that an anthem did not flow from his prolific pen. With the Rev. W. Mercer, Goss edited the Church Psalter and Hymnbook, another collection of chants and hymn tunes being included, in 1856, and in the same year succeeded William Knyvett as one of the composers to the Chapel Royal. The anthem heard in almost every Protestant church in our day, "O Savior of the World," was written in 1869.

> On 19 March, 1872---Goss received the honour of knighthood from Queen Victoria and her thanks for his music. Four years later the degree of Doctor in Music, honoris causa, was conferred on him by the University of Cambridge, his distinguished pupil, Arthur Sullivan, receiving on the same day a like distinction. 12

Surrounded thus by respect and honor, Sir John Goss died on May 10, 1880, in Brixton.

Although only one of the tunes of Goss is found in The Lutheran Hymnal and two in the Common Service Book and Hymnal, the influence of this early composer of the period should not be underestimated. His works served as a guide to many of the younger musicians, and he was personally associated with a number of them. In addition to the previous references, his works included The Organist's Companion, a series of voluntaries and interludes, many services, and a volume which reached 13 editions, An Introduction to Harmony and Thorough-bass. Brown and Stratton list 27 anthems by Goss

---

12. Ibid., p. 524.

in British Musical Biography (p. 168).

Henry Smart, the son of a well-known and highly accomplished violinist, was born in London on October 26, 1913. His father had served in various theater orchestras of the day and later became the proprietor of a brewery which failed. The elder Smart then established a piano manufactory[13] which proved rather profitable. Henry's uncle was more famous and probably a greater influence musically. For 45 years this uncle, Sir George Smart, served as organist and composer to the Chapel Royal (as co-worker with Goss for a number of years), but showed his greatest aptitudes as conductor and teacher of singing.[14] Unlike most of the other leaders of the latter half of the 19th century, Henry Smart did not study in a Cathedral Choir. He studied with his father for a time, later with W. H. Kearns, but was self-taught to quite an extent. Like the other leaders, Smart held in succession several organistships, beginning in 1831 after he decided against the profession of solicitor. The first of these positions was at the parish church of Blackburn. During the four years here, he composed his first important work, an anthem for the tercentenary of the Reformation. He served at St. Philip's Chapel, Regent Street, from 1838-1839, was married in 1840, and four years later began his twenty-year organistship at St. Luke's, Old

---

13. James Duff Brown and Stephen S. Stratton, "Henry Smart," British Musical Biography, p. 378.
14. Bumpus, op. cit., p. 497.

Street. His final position was at St. Pancras, Euston Road. For many years his sight had been failing and soon after 1864, he became too blind to write. He continued to compose by dictation, however. His end came on July 6, 1879, the same year the government had granted him an annual pension of 100 pounds.

Smart was a prolific song writer and an excellent organist, as his many positions indicate. Through the years, his knowledge of the organ mechanism became profound and was used to design a number of instruments. Bumpus states that he wrote for the orchestra with great power and originality.[15] He also wrote operas, cantatas, many part-songs, edited a hymnal for the United Presbyterian Church, and the Chorale Book. "Lightwood says that in this latter book Smart has done for the English hymn-tune what Bach did for the German chorale."[16] Smart also contributed to many collections of tunes and some of his best are found in Hymns Ancient and Modern. The Lutheran Hymnal makes use of three of his hymn tunes, one, Regent Square, five times, while the Common Service Book and Hymnal lists eight of them.

George Job Elvey, born in Canterbury on March 27, 1816, began his musical education as a chorister of Canterbury Cathedral under Highmore Skeats, the organist. After leaving the choir, Elvey continued his studies under his elder

---

15. Ibid., p. 499.
16. Polack, op. cit., p. 579.

brother, Stephen, and later under Cipriani Potter and Dr. William Crotch at the Royal Academy of Music. In 1834 he, too, gained the Gresham Prize Medal, for his anthem,"Bow Down Thine Ear." The next year he was appointed to succeed Highmore Skeats, Jr., son of his noted teacher, as organist of St. George's Chapel, Windsor, a post which he held until his retirement in 1882. Harriet, the daughter of his predecessor, later became his wife. He graduated as Bachelor of Music from Oxford in 1838, and as Doctor of Music two years later. During his long period of office at St. George's Chapel, he managed the arrangement of the music in connection with many important events in the Royal family, including the marriage of the Prince of Wales (1863), of Princess Louise (1871), and of the Duke of Albany (1882). He was married three more times in addition to the union with Harriet Skeats. In 1871 he received his knighthood from the Queen, and died in Windelsham, Surry, on December 9, 1893. His widow, a sister of an ex-Lord Mayor of London, published The Life and Reminiscences of Sir George Elvey the following year.

In general, Elvey's works included oratorios, morning and evening services, cathedral chants, glees and part-songs (he conducted the Glee and Madrigal Society), a few compositions for orchestra, various works for the organ and for the violin, and hymn tunes found in Hymns Ancient and Modern and other collections. His tunes that have found their way

into The Lutheran Hymnal are: St. George, used with five hymns; St. Crispin, found with five hymns; and Diademata.

Edward John Hopkins was born on June 30, 1818, in Westminster, and began his musical career as a chorister of the Chapel Royal under William Hawes at the age of eight. His musical background was limited to an uncle, Edward, who was a bandmaster and the first clarinet player of his day.[17] On leaving the choir in 1833, he studied under Thomas Forbes Walmisley. Even before he secured the appointment of organist of Mitcham Church at the age of 16, Hopkins had played for services at Westminster Abbey. He held two other organistships before beginning his long and famous stay at Temple Church. These were St. Peter's, Islington, and St. Luke's, Berwick Street, which he left in 1843. For the next 55 years his talents were used largely at Temple Church, where, under his care, the musical service acquired a great renown. He was almost unrivalled as an accompanist and demonstrated his abilities as a concert organist in his own church as well as in recitals all over the country until 1896. His anthems, Out of the Deep and God Is Gone Up, obtained the Gresham Prize Medal in 1838 and 1840 respectively. His great interest in the organ led him to be one of the founders of the College of Organists and professor of organ at the Royal Normal College for the Blind, Norwood.

---

17. Brown and Stratton, "Edward John Hopkins," op. cit., p. 206.

His writings about the organ, particularly The Organ, Its History and Construction, have influenced organ building until our own day. He contributed several articles on the subject to the first edition of George Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Hopkins also edited ancient music, primarily Bennet's Madrigals, and Weelkes's First Set of Madrigals for the Musical Antiquarian Society, and the musical portion of The Temple Church Choral Service (1898). The Archbishop of Canterbury conferred the degree of Doctor of Music on him in 1882. He had sung at the coronation of William IV in 1831, and lived to join the choir at the diamond Jubilee of Queen Victoria in 1897. Hopkins retired from his duties at Temple Church in 1898, and after a few years rest, died in London on February 4, 1901.

The works of Hopkins follow the lines of the other leaders---anthems, madrigals, part-songs, services, chants, and hymn tunes, of which not a few "hold an assured place in the repertory of English Church Music."[18] Earlier he had also helped to complete the Wesleyan Tune Book, begun by H. J. Gauntlett and George Cooper. His tune, Ellers, is the only one used in The Lutheran Hymnal, while five of them are utilized in the Common Service Book and Hymnal.

The place of William Henry Monk in a study of this period is unquestioned because of his work as editor of the

---

18. Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, II, s. v., "Edward John Hopkins," p. 664.

"hymnbook of the century," Hymns Ancient and Modern. He was born in London on March 16, 1823, and his musical education was gained mostly at the feet of T. Adams, J. A. Hamilton, and G. A. Griesbach. He became organist of Eaton Chapel, Pimlico, in 1841, and served in the same capacity successively at St. George's Chapel, Albermarle Street, and Protman Chapel, Marylebone, until the year 1847. At this time he became associated with King's College in London, where he was first, choirmaster, 1847, later organist, 1849, and upon the resignation of John Hullah in 1874, finally became professor of vocal music. Earlier he had been closely associated with Hullah in the work of popular musical education. He also became professor of music at the School for the Indigent Blind in 1851 and in the National Training College for Music in 1876. His last post as organist was at St. Matthias Church, Stoke Newington, which he began in 1852. Here a volunteer choir under his direction presented daily choral services for many years.[19] He was appointed to another professorship at Bedford College, London, in 1878, and received the Doctor of Music degree, honoris causa, from Durham College seven years before his death in London, March 1, 1889.

In addition to his achievements as a scholarly lecturer in England and Scotland, he produced a considerable amount

---

19. Ibid., s. v., "William Henry Monk," III, p. 495.

of musical compositions. Besides hymn tunes, these included: Te Deums, Kyries, anthems, and other works for the church services. Perhaps his greatest work, however, was that of musical editor of several collections of hymns and tunes. He worked on the Book of Psalms in Meter, The Psalter, Book of Anthems, and a hymnal, for the Church of Scotland.[20] His outstanding accomplishment was the editing of Hymns Ancient and Modern, a title which he suggested. Lutkin, speaking of this great work writes of Monk: ".....his taste and musicianship had much to do with the enormous success of that book. His contribution of 35 original tunes is by no means the least attractive feature of that model hymnal."[21]

We now turn to the biography of John Bacchus Dykes, held by manyto be the outstanding leader in the writing of hymn tunes during this century. Suffice it to say that the rise of this style may be said to date from 1857 when Dykes wrote his earliest published group of 13 tunes for Grey's Manual, though the characteristics of the style were hardly then fully developed.[22]

The son of a banker and the grandson of a clergyman, the Rev. Thomas Dykes, John Dykes was born at Hull, March 10, 1823. His grandfather was the incumbent at St. John's Church

---

20. The Oxford History of Music, "Presbyterian Church Music," p. 747: "It is notable that the editors employed for the first tune books of these various bodies were Englishmen and organists in the Anglican Church....."
21. Peter Christian Lutkin, Music in the Church, p. 29.
22. Hymns Ancient and Modern, Historical Edition, p. CIV.

in this city, and it is from the organist of this church, Skelton, that Dykes received his first musical training. He gained additional education at the propriety school at Wakeful, and at the age of 20 entered St. Catherine's Hall, Cambridge. As an undergraduate here, he helped found the University Musical Society and became its conductor.[23] Through the influence of his grandfather, Dykes took holy orders, and in 1847, the same year he graduated as B. A. from Cambridge, he received the curacy of Malton, Yorkshire. Two years later, in July, he was appointed Minor Canon and Precentor of Durham Cathedral. In 1850 he received his Master's from Cambridge and married Susan, the daughter of George Kingston of Malton. After eleven years at Durham Cathedral, the University of Durham conferred on him the degree of Doctor of Music, and the following year he was presented to the vicarage of St. Oswald, Durham. When Dykes' High-church tendencies were forcefully opposed here by his bishop, Dykes received a shock from which he never fully recovered.[24] Grove's Dictionary adds that "beyond his musical repute he was much esteemed as a theologian."[25] His health finally gave way in 1875, and he died at St. Leonards-on-Sea, on January 22, 1876.

Dykes differs from the other leading musicians of this

---

23. Polack, op. cit., p. 502.
24. Ibid.
25. Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, II, s. v., "John Bacchus Dykes," p. 133.

period in that most of his efforts were directed toward the writing of hymn tunes. His other works for the service were negligible. He wrote 300 hymn tunes and took an active part in the compilation of Hymns Ancient and Modern in which his tunes played so important a role. Dean Lutkin concludes: "Enough has been quoted from Dykes to prove that he is easily first among moderns in his art."[26] Of his 300 tunes, seven are used in The Lutheran Hymnal, and uniquely enough, each with only one set of words. More will be said of this later. These tunes are: St. Cross; Nicaea; Vox Dilecti; Beatitudo; St. Agnes; Alford; and St. Mary Magdalene. 31 of Dykes' tunes are used 41 times in the Common Service Book and Hymnal.

In Sir Joseph Barnby, we have another leading composer of hymn tunes during the last half of the 19th century. He contributed 250 tunes to the hymnals of the period, and, a knowledge of his life and work is essential to a fuller understanding of development of the hymn tune during these years.

Born in York, August 12, 1838, Barnby became a chorister in York Minster at the age of seven. His other prodigious feats included teaching music at the age of ten, serving as organist when he was 12, and as music master of a school at 14. When he reached 16, he set out for London and the Royal Academy of Music, living with his brother Ro-

---

26. Lutkin, Music in the Church, p. 32.

bert, a vicar-choral of Westminster Abbey. He began a series of organistships at Mitcham Parish Church, returning to York for four years. Then successively at St. Michael's, Queenhithe, St. James the Less, Westminster, and, in 1863, St. Andrew's, Wells Street. Here he acquired and exercised the influence that worked many developments in the choral services of the church. He participated in the revival of Bach's music in England (cf. pp. 15, 16) by conducting a performance of Bach's St. Matthew Passion in Westminster Abbey on Maundy Thursday, 1871, with full orchestra and chorus, "a memorable event in the history of church music in this country."[27] In 1873, he introduced Bach's St. John Passion at St. Anne's, Soho, where he was then director of music. By 1886 he had resigned his positions in churches and had organized "Mr. Joseph Barnby's Choir" which devoted itself to the performance of the larger choral works.[28] From 1886 until 1888, Barnby conducted the Royal Academy of Music Concerts. He had received the precentorship of Eton College in 1875, but resigned this in 1892 when he was made principal of the Guildhall School of Music. Also during this time, he devoted 15 years as musical adviser to the firm, Novello, Ewer, and Co. In the same year that he came

---

27. Brown and Stratton, "Sir Joseph Barnby," op. cit., p. 26.

28. This choir was later amalgamated with one led by M. Gounod and called the Royal Albert Hall Choral Society, as which it has played an important part in the recent history of English choral singing.

to Guildhall, Barnby received the honor of knighthood from the Queen. He died rather suddenly four years later on January 28.

The works of Barnby are numerous, touching almost all forms of religious and some of secular music. Brown and Stratton list, among others, a sacred Idyll, Service in E., Magnificat and Nunc Dimittis in E Flat for voices, various works for orchestra and organ, 46 anthems, a motet, carols, trios, and songs, all in addition to the 250 hymn tunes mentioned previously.

John Stainer was a native of London. He was born there on June 6, 1840, and seven years later began his nine-year stay as chorister at St. Paul's Cathedral. During this time he often acted as organist and had several of his own selections performed. Through the liberality of Miss Hackett (cf. p. 22) he received a course of organ lessons from George Cooper at St. Sepulchre's. W. Bayley and Dr. Steggall also had him as a pupil. Stainer began his long career as organist, at St. Benedict and St. Peter's, Paul's Wharf, in 1854, and two years later the Rev. Sir Frederick Ousley appointed him organist of St. Michael's, Tenbury. After three years, he entered Christ Church, Oxford, and was appointed organist of Magdalen College. The next year he became organist of the University of Oxford. His degrees came rather quickly, Mus. Bac. 1859, B. A. 1863, Mus. Doc. 1865, and M. A. 1866. Stainer succeeded Sir John Goss

as organist of St. Paul's Cathedral in 1872, when Goss resigned because of his failing sight. Later Stainer served as professor of organ and as principal of the National Training School for Music, succeeding Sir. Arthur Sullivan in the latter position. He held several other positions of honor, culminating in the Professorship of Music at Oxford University. He also received the degree of Mus. D., honoris causa, from Durham University, and was knighted by Queen Victoria in 1888. Stainer's death took place in Verona, Italy, on March 31, 1901, and he lies buried at Holywell Cemetery, Oxford.

In addition to his hymn tunes, Stainer produced an oratorio, cantatas, church services, canticles, anthems, madrigals, and arrangements for the organ. His famous cantata, The Crucifixion, was written in London in 1887. His editorial endeavors were A Dictionary of Musical Terms, done jointly with W. A. Barrett, and Carols Old and New with the Rev. H. R. Bramley. He wrote several books on organ, harmony, and compositions, and The Music of the Bible in 1879, and two of his children did research work for the first edition of Grove's Dictionary.

Arthur Seymour Sullivan was the son of Thomas Sullivan, an Irish soldier who became Sergeant of the Band at the Royal Military College, Sandhurst, and eventually professor of the clarinet at Kneller Hall when that institution opened in 1857. Besides the practical orchestral training he received

from his father, Arthur continued his general education at a private school at Bayswater under Mr. W. G. Plees. On April 12, 1854, he entered Chapel Royal as a chorister on the recommendation of Sir George Smart, and received the systematic instruction of the Rev. Thomas Helmore, master of the children. His musical progress under these influences was rapid. His first composition to be published, O Israel, was accepted by Novello when he was only 13 and still a chorister. In July 1856, in open competition, he became the first holder of the newly established "Mendelssohn Scholarship" at the Royal Academy of Music. He left the Chapel Royal the next year and spent a year under Sir John Goss, Sterndale Bennett, and O'leary at the Royal Academy of Music. Under the terms of the scholarship he was enabled to go to Leipzig to further his education and arrived there in the autumn of 1858. Sullivan remained there for three years, "steeping himself in German taste and tradition, full of reverance for German thoroughness and method, yet still maintaining sturdily his own remarkable artistic individuality."[29] His instructors were Plaidy, Hauptmann, E. F. Richter, and Moscheles and others of this center of German musical culture.

On his return to London, Sullivan's music to Shakespeare's Tempest, composed in Leipzig, was produced as a Crystal Palace Saturday concert. It was repeated the follow-

---

29. Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, V, s. v., "Sir Arthur Seymour Sullivan," p. 187.

ing week and Sullivan awoke to find himself famous. For a time he was organist at St. Michael's, Chester Square, and at St. Peter's, Onslow Gardens, but soon began to try his hand at comic opera. In 1871 he produced "Thespis, or The God's Grown Old," not wholly successfully, but the importance lies in its being his first association with the famous English humorist, W. S. Gilbert. At this same time, Sullivan became engaged in editing The Hymnary for Novello, and also the collection of Church Hymns with Tunes. He wrote a large number of original tunes for both of these endeavors, among them his famous setting of Onward! Christian Soldiers (1872). His light operas produced with Gilbert have attained unparalleled success. In January of 1878 he suffered the loss of his brother Stephen, at which time he wrote what is perhaps his most popular song, The Lost Chord.[30] He became musical director of the Royal Aquarium, and principal of the National Training School for Music and professor of composition, a position he resigned in 1881. Along with his colleague, Gilbert, he visited America in 1879 to protect their light opera interests, and Sullivan returned here in 1885 at which time he conducted The Mikado in New York City. In 1876 he received degrees of Mus. D., both honoris causa, from Cambridge and Oxford respectively. Through the years the people began to look to him on days

---

30. Ibid., p. 188.

of national importance for a musical expression of public feeling, and a number of his compositions were thus inspired. As his health began to fail, honor after honor fell on his shoulders. He received the Legion of Honor from France in 1878, knighthood from the Queen in 1883, and was instituted as grand-organist of the Freemasons in 1887. However, by 1898 the lifelong, painful malady had undermined his constitution. "It is a harrowing thought that a very great number of his most sparkling and delicious melodies were written at intervals between spasms of the illness."[31] Sullivan died on the morning of November 22, 1900, in Westminster, at the age of 58.

Sullivan's musical efforts, in addition to his popular comic operas, included orchestral works, songs, and sacred music in the form of oratorios, cantatas, anthems, and hymn tunes.

Turning to an English church musician of our own day, we find that Ralph Vaughan Williams is generally accepted as the outstanding leader in this field. He was born on October 12, 1872, in Down Ampney, Gloucestershire, the son of the Rev. Arthur Vaughan Williams. He received his edu- at Charterhouse (1887-1890) and Trinity College, Cambridge (1892-1895). He spent the two years between in musical study at the Royal College of music, and returned here after receiving his Bachelor's degree in music at Cambridge. His

---

31. Ibid., p. 190.

main object was always composition, but he also studied organ and piano. Neither of these two instruments influenced his output to a great degree, although his three-year organistship at South Lambeth Church showed him the need for good hymn tunes. His Sine Nomine written for Bishop Walsham How's hymn For all the Saints is considered one of the best tunes written in recent years.[32] In 1905 he undertook the editorship of The English Hymnal, and has also served on the editorial boards of some modern American hymnals. Vaughan Williams' work has by no means been limited to the interests of the church, and his efforts in the secular field have also received wide acclaim.

---

32. Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, V, s. v., "Ralph Vaughan Williams," p. 459.

IV. PRINCIPLES OF HYMN TUNE WRITING IN THIS PERIOD AND THE INFLUENCE ON AMERICAN HYMNODY

Thus far we have outlined the historical background and given the biographical data for this period of church music and the nine men with whom we are chiefly concerned. By means of a graph we now intend to trace the influence of their tunes on American hymnals. Before we do this, however, we will first turn to a study of the principles involved in the approach of these men to hymn tune writing. Our aim is to study the concepts that prevailed in these times on how a hymn tune should sound.

Winfred Douglas[1] lists three primary movements that brought about the leadership of the Anglican Church in the writing of hymn tunes. The first is the Evangelical Revival with its intense desire to win the souls of men, resulting in the missionary expansion of the Anglican Church throughout the world. Next he lists the Tractarian Movement, which stressed a return to the fulness of the ancient faith and practice. Finally, a confused movement, described as caring for the minds of men as well as for their souls and bodies, is to have exerted an influence.[2]

Undoubtedly the Wesleys and those who caught the impli-

---

1. Co-worker of Dean Lutkin at the School of Music of Northwestern University. In his book, Church Music in History and Practice, he calls this period "The Triumph of Anglican Eclectic Hymnody," cf. p. 244.
2. Ibid., pp. 244-245.

cation of the congregational song in the lives of Christian people, set the stage for the rise of new hymnals. Where before it had been an ecclesiastical offense to publish a hymnal without the full authorization of the church hierarchy (which was difficult enough to obtain), the influence of the Evangelistic Revival led to too many hymnals, 150 being published in England during the first 50 years of the 19th century.[3] For many years the most important of these hymnals was the one produced by Reginald Heber.

But the so-called Oxford Tractarian Movement (1833-1841) followed. The outcome of the 90 Tracts, as far as Church Music is concerned, was primarily an interest in the old Latin Hymns, in order with the overall appeal to antiquity which the movement bore. However, these translators of ancient hymns did not burden themselves with the music of the hymns involved.

In this same year, 1833, another element sprang into being, that is, a renewed interest in the Folksong Carol. This movement was sponsored originally by a lawyer, William Sandys, who had interested himself in antiquarian research. His work is similar to that of Johann Gottfried von Herder with the German folksong during the late 18th century. Sandys thought that the carol was neglected more every year[4]

---

3. Ibid.
4. Ibid., p. 251.

and from his small beginning has sprung a great revival of carol singing and an adoption of folksong as a legitimate source of music for hymns. In secular music this parallels the Romantic movement in its more democratic spirit, as expressed in the music of von Weber, Mendelssohn, Schumann, Wagner, Berlioz, Chopin, Liszt, and others.[5]

Following this, Dr. Henry J. Gauntlett, especially through his Gregorian Hymnal, roused a new respect for the Plainsong Hymn. The result was that no hymnal that appeared after 1850 neglected these ancient tunes.

One further step toward the culmination of this period is the appearance of Hymns Ancient and Modern and the new tunes which it contained were the publication of William Mercer's Church Psalter and Hymn Book in 1854. The book is important for two reasons: 1. it was the first important general hymnal to include tunes as well as words, for congregational use; and, 2. it re-introduced the German Chorale to Anglican use.[6] Miss Catherine Winkworth followed up this lead with her many excellent translations which brought more and more of these German hymns and their tunes into common use in England. The climax of the entire period then was the publication of Hymns Ancient and Modern in 1861. This hymnal is a climax not only because of its eclectic

---

5. Cf. Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, IV, s. v., "Romantic," p. 420; The Oxford History of Music, s. v. "Romantic," pp. 809-810.

6. Winfred Douglas, A Brief Commentary on "Selected Hymns and Carols," p. 253.

character, but also because it introduced to England a new type of hymn tune.

Perhaps the general principles that brought about this new hymn tune can be best discussed under five heads. The first would be: the hymn tune composers of this period were trained musicians. By hymn tune composers we mean the ones previously mentioned and discussed, of course. These men were trained musicians, a few even were child prodigies. Most of them had comparatively extensive training in the leading schools and under the outstanding teachers of the day. They were not just organists that felt an irrepressible urge to give their congregations some variety in hymn tunes. They very likely had this urge, but it was coupled closely with their innate and acquired abilities as trained musicians.

Secondly, the hymn tune writers in question were devout Christians. These men were steeped in the teachings and traditions of the Anglican Church, and each spent many years in the service of his church as organist or choir conductor. The Anglican composers were influenced to a great degree by the liturgical setting into which most of their hymns were designed to fit. Their Christian indoctrination showed itself also through the many anthems and service music which they produced, all of which was intended to aid in the congregation's worship, and therefore that of the individual worshiper. The austere traditions of the Anglican Church restrain efforts after the brilliant and emotional within

distinctly marked boundaries. Its music can never, as the Catholic mass has often done, relapse into the tawdry and sensational, but the English church composers have recognized that the Church and its art exist for the people, and that the changing standards of beauty as they arise in the popular mind must be considered, while at the same time the serene and elevated tone which makes church music truly churchly must be reverently preserved. This, as I understand it, is the motive, more or less conscious, which actuates the Church of England composers, organists, and directors of the present day.[7] Although we cannot always agree that Barnby and Sullivan adhered to the principle of preserving the serene and elevated tone in their church music, the fact that generally they conceived of church music as existing for the people is an important consideration in evaluating their music for public worship.

Thirdly, for the most of these musicians, the words always bore a close relationship to the tune. To some extent this is a result of the hymn writing movement that reached its climax with Heber's hymnal. The translations of Latin and German hymns are also involved. These men wrote tunes in the musical idiom of their day to fit the words they had at hand. These Anglican composers sought to express the feeling and content of the words in the musical setting they

---

7. Dickinson, op. cit., pp. 355-356. Underlining my own.

gave to the hymns. Dickinson endeavors, at great length, to trace the reason for a change in the style of the hymn tune to the change in style of the hymn writing itself.[8]

Fourthly, the secular music of the day, both in England and on the continent, had an effect on these writers. This is to be understood in two ways: 1. some tunes were taken from secular sources; and 2. the condition of secular music in general affected the tastes of these composers. Of the first we have no doubt, nor do we offer criticism. Many of the best melodies in the Lutheran and Calvinistic song books had a similar origin.[9] This gave the "new school" a wider range of choice and greater liberty. Keeping in mind the ideals of church music of their day, the composers would judiciously choose melodies from various secular sources.[10] These sources varied but were often the glee or madrigal, which reached great popularity both among the people and among the musicians of the day.

That leads to the second consideration of this point. The secular music of the day affected the hymn tune writers also in the sense that their musical tastes were conditioned by it. This not easily established, althought we can have but little doubt that the extensive secular endeavors of Sullivan and Barnby influenced and cheapened much of their efforts in the field of church music.

---

8. Dickinson, op. cit., p. 388.
9. Ibid., p. 383.
10. Breed, op. cit., p. 308.

The "modern school"

> tended to make the hymn a pretty thing to be heard: not a vital expression of religious faith to be uttered. It was inevitable that this phase should appear. A general movement such as Romanticism has its weak elements as well as its strong ones. 11

Perhaps a stronger relationship exists between these hymns and some of the secular music of the day than we realize. The hymn tunes were undoubtedly very closely allied to the secular part-songs of the period.[12] This bears out the influence of the composition of glees and madrigals noted in the biographical sketches in Chapter III. The part-song was a 19th century development of the older madrigals and glees. It differed from these earlier forms in that it was a product of the large choral societies of the period and was intended for singing by many voices to a part. This explains, in part, such comments as:

> While some of Barnby's tunes are preeminently successful, a certain number of them belong to the category known as "choir tunes," that is, tunes which on account of their harmonic complexity are ill-adapted for congregational use and better suited to a well-trained choir, 13

and

> Many of them are, it must be confessed, over-sophisticated for the use of the average congregation, carrying refinements of harmony and rhythm to such a point that they are more suitable for the choir than for the congregation. 14

The part-song differs from the madrigal also in that it is

---

11. Douglas, op. cit., p. 255.
12. Hymns Ancient and Modern, Historical Edition, p. CIV; cf. Douglas, op. cit., p. 255.
13. Lutkin, Music in the Church, p. 35.
14. Dickinson, op. cit., p. 384.

not entirely contrapuntal, but more of the nature of a melody in the top part, accompanied by harmonies in the lower voices, much like the hymn itself. The part-song differs from the glee in that the former is generally written for mixed voices and is not intended for solo voices, again resembling the hymn.[15]

In this connection we may note that throughout this period, the anthem, especially through the influence of Samuel Sebastian Wesley, enjoyed great popularity. Like the hymn, it received its impetus from the post-Reformation era. It was the English version of the Latin motet and at first anthems were merely adaptations of the older motets. Through the work of Byrd and Gibbons, solo passages with organ or string accompaniment were introduced, and this new form or church music continued to flourish in the hands of Thomas Tallis, Christopher Tye, and Robert Whyte.[16] Later, under John Blow and Henry Purcell, the anthem was made more complex and of greater length, including arias, quartets, and duets. It followed this pattern in the 18th century, and to some degree also in the 19th, under the leadership of Wesley. Undoubtedly, since the same men composed anthems and hymn tunes, the development of the anthem influences the hymn tunes of the day.

The final consideration of the principles of these 19th

---

15. The Oxford History of Music, "Part-song," pp. 688-689.
16. Lang, op. cit., p. 282.

century hymn tunes is related to the previous one. The composers of this time depended on the harmonies of the tune more than had been done before in England. The strength and vigor of the earlier tunes gave place to "more sinuous melodic curves" and weaker harmonies.[17] This is not true of all the composers of the period, nor of all the tunes of certain composers. Some, inspired by the ancient psalm tunes, produced solid tunes of lasting character, to be sure. However, others, while avoiding the floridness of the late 18th century, fell into similar mistakes and strove for catchy melodies and luscious harmonies. These tunes seem more like part-songs than hymns

> An illustration of Barnby's emphasis on harmony is his much admired "Merrial" (1868) to "Now the Day is Over." The melody, it will be observed, in both the first and last of the four lines is entirely confined to one note, the interest centering on the movement of the alto, tenor, and particularly the bass. J. Spencer Curwen, of tonic sol-fa fame, in his interesting Studies in Worship Music, decries this tendency to transfer the interest from the melody to the other parts. He gives a clever "reductio ad absurdum" of this principle by writing a tune consisting of repeated notes, accompanied by rather elaborate harmonies, and succeeds in making quite an interesting piece of music. 18

Neither Barnby's nor Curwen's overemphasis of harmony proves this phase of the hymn tune's development is necessarily bad. Bach's harmonizations are chromatic and yet

---

17. Lutkin, Selected Hymns and Carols, Foreword
18. Lutkin, Music in the Church, pp. 38-39.

considered of great churchly value. The fact that many of the tunes of this "modern school" have survived in formal worship use is added proof that this tendency does not destroy a tune's worth.

Influenced in a greater or lesser degree by these principles, the nine leaders of the period composed hymn tune after hymn tune. 208 of these tunes found their way into Hymns Ancient and Modern. From here they exerted an influence on all other hymnals published in England and America. By means of the following graph we trace their influence in the Episcopal, Methodist, and Lutheran churches of America. In addition to the tunes of the English leaders, we have listed the tunes of the foremost American hymn tune writer of the 19th century, Lowell Mason.

In connection with the influence of these tunes on American hymnals, a discussion of Dr. Lowell Mason is in order.

Dr. Lowell Mason is the only American hymn tune writer of great note. As previously stated, Mason's relationship to the hymn writers of the era of Hymns Ancient and Modern is debatable. A good deal of his work was done before most of the English composers became active; however, we have little reason to make a direct connection between these two movements on two continents. Suffice it to say that along with the composers listed above and the lesser lights of their period, Mason is the only other man to affect American hymn singing to any great degree.

Composer	Hymns Ancient and Modern (1916)	The Hymnal (Episcopal) (1892)		The Methodist Hymnal (1905)		Common Service Book (U.L.C.) (1917)	Sunday School Hymnal (Mo. Syn.) (1901)	Evangelical Lutheran Hymn Book (Mo. Syn.) (1931)	The Lutheran Hymnal (Mo. Syn.) (1941)		The Hymnal (Episcopal) (1940)
Goss	5	5	(7)	1	(1)	3	0	1	1		2
Smart	18	11	(16)	6	(10)	14	5	3	3	(7)	12
Elvey	5	3	(5)	3	(6)	6	3	3	3	(11)	3
Hopkins	11	8	(8)	7	(7)	7	2	4	1		3
Monk	58	15	(18)	4	(6)	21	6	6	3	(5)	13
Dykes	59	46	(67)	29	(49)	44	17	21	7		27
Barnby	15	36	(48)	35	(51)	13	2	11	3	(5)	9
Stainer	31	18	(24)	10	(13)	10	5	2	1		3
Sullivan	6	20	(23)	13	(17)	14	3	5	2		12
(Mason)	1	8	(11)	31	(54)	13	9	15	8	(11)	8

The numbers in brackets indicate the number of times the tunes of the specified composer are used in the designated hymnal. Because the Sunday School Hymnal does not list the hymn tune composers, the list for that work is only approximate.

Lowell Mason was born in Medfield, Massachusetts, January 8, 1792. He spent the first years of his life learning to play any and every musical instrument he could find and spent some time directing a church choir in his home town. In 1812 he moved to Savannah, Georgia, where he found a position as clerk in a bank, but continued to teach and practice music. He was active first in the Independent Presbyterian Church, and, in 1827, helped found First Presbyterian Church. With the aid of his teacher, F. L. Abel, Mason formed a collection of psalm tunes based on Gardiner's Sacred Melodies, "itself extracted from the works of Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven."[19] At first he had difficulty finding a publisher for the volume. However, in Boston, through the interest of George K. Jackson, the manuscript was presented to the Board of Management of the Boston Handel and Haydn Society which agreed to publish it.[20] The work became immensely popular and ran through 17 editions, bringing a net profit of about $12,000 each for the Society and for Mason. The composer then moved to Boston and directed the music in several churches there, notably Bowdoin Street Church where Dr. Lyman Beecher was pastor. Here Mason began to concentrate his efforts as an organist. He became president of the Handel and Haydn Society, but because he was more in-

---

19. Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, "Lowell Mason," III, p. 341.
20. Polack, op. cit., p. 542.

terested in the introduction of music into the common schools, he left this post and with G. J. Webb formed the Boston Academy of Music in 1832. 1500 students attended the Academy in its first year and Mason's fame and influence spread. He began a movement for musical conventions all over the country which proved successful. In 1838 he obtained permission to teach in all the schools of Boston, enabling him to put his theories of musical education into practice there. Mason produced a number of manuals and collections which added to his earlier fortune. He visited Germany in 1837, specifically to study their educational set-up and to confer with Pestalozzi whose writings had influenced his interest in the training of the youth. The degree of Mus.D.,he received from New York University in 1835 was "not absolutely the first" of its kind, "but certainly the first of distinction."[21] He made a second European trip in 1853, of which his Musical Letters from Abroad is an account. He spent the last years of his life in Orange, New Jersey, the home of his sons.[22] He died there on August 11, 1872.

In his hymn tune writing, Lowell Mason was greatly influenced by the secular music that was popular in his day. His association with the Handel and Haydn Society brought about a great influence in their music. Many of his tunes,

---

21. Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, Amer. Supp., "Lowell Mason," p. 586.

22. His son, Henry, later manufactured pianos, while Daniel and Lowell, jr., established a publishing firm.

especially the first ones, were admittedly based on melodies from their compositions, as well as from other classical music. Mason did not follow the pattern of the Anglican musicians in his approach to the hymn tune. As mentioned before, they wrote tunes to fit the words they had at hand. Mason reversed this process.

> Mason did not write tunes to specific hymns, but wrote a tune and then found a hymn that suited it. Superficially considered that would seem like inverting the natural order; but it had its advantages. If the tune had been composed to a specific hymn, the temptation would have been irresistible to give expression to its smaller phrases and it would have been unfitted for any other hymn. This would do for a few tunes like "Nearer my God, to Thee" or "My Faith Looks up to Thee," but the mass of hymn tunes must be self-contained and objective in order to carry hymns of varied emotions. 23

This comment assumes that the ideal is to have a few tunes to fit a large body of hymns, in contrast to the principle of the Anglican composers.

Mason's musical efforts outside of his hymn tunes are not great. However, the impact of his thought and ideals is still felt in American hymn singing. Besides his many original tunes, and those based on secular melodies, he arranged a good number of tunes of other church musicians. Of the entire number, about 30 have remained popular to this day.[24] For his influence on other hymnals, consult the graph opposite page 54.

---

23. Lorenz, op. cit., pp. 309-310.
24. Cf. New Baptist Hymnal, 1926, in which 30 of Mason's tunes are found.

V. THE APPLICABILITY OF THE NINETEENTH CENTURY ENGLISH HYMN TUNE TO LUTHERAN WORSHIP

We shall now approach the task of evaluating the hymn tunes produced in this period by the composers we have studied. We shall do this only in the light of their applicability to Lutheran worship. No other consideration is to be involved. In an evaluation of this type, we must be sure that we use just methods of judging the tunes. It is easy to be subjective in judgment. We have seen that the tunes in question have often been criticized as being lush and as having seductive, weak harmonies of a chromatic tendency.[1] We have no assurance, however, that such judgments are made according to just standards or that they are made in consideration of the moods of the tunes as well as the aptness of musical expression.

In chapter I we have outlined the demands of Lutheran worship. Doctrinally, Lutheran worship is the expression of strong faith in the Atonement by the corporate church and resulting in moods of joy. Traditionally, Lutheran worship demands hymns by the people that are in the vernacular and in an idiom of music that is close to popular capacity. Furthermore, these hymns have always been associated with and sung to the accompaniment of the organ. With these demands in mind, we will evaluate these tunes appearing in The Luth-

---

1. Cf. Douglas, op. cit., p. 255.

eran Hymnal, published by the Evangelical Lutheran Synodical Conference of North America in 1941.

In the previous chapter we have discussed the principles involved in the composition of these tunes. We have seen that these men were trained musicians, accomplished organists in each instance. Their training had the background of the polyphonic movement in the earlier history of English Church Music. We have seen that they have not hesitated to use folksong material for their tunes, especially since almost all of them were closely acquainted with the glee, madrigal, and part-song of the day. In this way they approached the Lutheran principle of worship that the individual Christian is important, as a member of the universal priesthood, and therefore both the words and the tunes of the hymns that he is to sing must be within his grasp. This, then, establishes the aptness of musical expression of the tunes under discussion, in all cases except Sullivan, whose only contributions to The Lutheran Hymnal are in the form of spiritual songs and are not in the hymn section proper.

Turning to the moods of these tunes, we will elaborate by listing the tunes under the hymn classifications of the hymnal, thus presenting the moods that these tunes represent. Under the heading of "Adoration," we find two tunes from this period: Ellers (47) by Hopkins and Regent Square (50) by Smart. Under the broad title of "The Church Year," we find the largest group of tunes from this period, ten in all,

although St. George, by Elvey, is used twice (71 and 134), under "Advent" and "Epiphany," respectively. We can understand this large number of tunes in the light of the association of these men with the liturgical Anglican Church. Within this communion they were always aware of the Church Year and its implications for the public worship. From these men, then, we would expect a goodly number of tunes written specifically for the observance of the holy days and seasons of the Church Year. The other tunes under this classification are: St. Cross (124) and Nicea (246) by Dykes; Regent Square (136), Lancashire (205), and Rex Gloriae (218) by Smart; Bevan (220) by John Goss; Coronae (222) by Monk; and St. Crispin (245), another tune by George Elvey.

The heading "Invitation" finds only one tune of this genus listed under it, the well-known Vox Dilecti by Dr. Dykes, set to the words I Heard the Voice of Jesus Say. This is not as small a contribution as it may seem, since only five different tunes are under this classification.

St. Crispin (304) by George Elvey is the only tune listed under "The Sacraments," and specifically under "The Lord's Supper." This tune was written originally for the hymn, Just As I Am, Without One Plea, and is used with these words under the heading of "Faith and Justification" in this same hymnal. In addition, we find it used under "The Church Year," once again under "Faith and Justification," and with a hymn

under the heading of "The Church."

Three tunes that are each associated with only one set of words in The Lutheran Hymnal are found in the classification of "The Redeemer." These are: Diademata (341) by Elvey and Beatitudo (360) and St. Agnes (361) by John Dykes. The Christian character of these men, and the school which they represent, is set forth in these tunes. We should note that the case here true of Dykes' tunes is true elsewhere in this hymnal. His tunes are uniformly found with but one set of words throughout the book.

Under "Faith and Justification" we find four tunes from these men used five times. Elvey's St. Crispin (371 and 388) appears twice, in both instances with hymns asserting the Christian's subjective trust in the merits of the Savior. Stainer's Magdalen (370), Monk's Energy (374) and Dunstan (390) also create the mood of the individual's assurance in salvation through faith in Christ. We note that in another area of Lutheran emphasis, faith and justification, we find four noteworthy contributions from these English hymn tune writers.

"Sanctification," on the other hand, has but two tunes from the period and one of these, Energy (441), by Monk is also used under the classifications of "Faith and Justification," as just mentioned, and "The Church." It is a tune of congregational mood, with the words here found, or with those with which it originally appeared in Hymns Ancient and Modern,

Soldiers of Christ, Arise.[2] The other tune under this heading is Winterton (403 and 422) by Joseph Barnby. In both instances it is used under the subheading of "New Obedience."

Five of the nine English composers are represented under the title "The Church." Barnby's Galilean (469 and 496) is used under both "Communion of Saints" and "Missions," two subtitles of the classification. Monk's Energy (468) appears for the second time in the hymnal, Elvey's St. Crispin (499) for the fifth time, in addition to Dykes' Alford (476) and Henry Smart's Regent Square (502). Energy, Galilean, and Alford are used in the mood of corporate joy in the knowledge that the saints on earth will join those above in endless glory. The others are expressions of the church's responsibility in spreading the Good News. Barnby's Galilean, coupled with the words Hark! The Voice of Jesus Crying, emphasizes the personal responsibility in this work. These contributions to the moods of the doctrine of "The Church" are especially noteworthy because this section lists few tunes of German Lutheran origin.

Under the heading of "Cross and Comfort" we find Dr. Dykes' St. Mary Magdalene (516) set to the hymn In the Hour of Trial. This is the only contribution from these men under this heading.

---

2. Cf. The Lutheran Hymnal, No. 450.

The broad classification of "Times and Seasons" brings two tunes by these English composers to our attention. The first, Eventide (552), by William Monk, is found under the subhead "Evening," with the popular hymn Abide with Me! Fast Falls the Eventide. The moods is one of the individual's complete trust and reliance in the crucified Lord. The second is Elvey's St. George (566, 547, 584), used to express the corporate feeling of praise and thanks to the merciful Lord, under the heading of "Harvest and Thanksgiving," and again under "The Nation." Henry Smart's Regent Square (641) is found once more with a hymn in behalf of "Theological Institutions," under the general heading of "Special Occasions."

The only tunes remaining are the two from the hand of Sir. Arthur Sullivan. Both are not found in the hymn section proper, as previously mentioned, but under "Carols and Spiritual Songs." The hymn tune titles are St. Gertrude (658) and Heaven Is My Home (660). These tunes have not come up to the standards set by the music editors of the hymnal, a condition accounted for in part of Sullivan's close association with secular music. In these tunes he emphasizes the music and harmony for their own sakes, rather than seeking to produce moods which are purely subservient to the concepts of the hymn with which they are used.

We see, then, that these 19th century composers of the English Church have contributed tunes of definite value to

American Lutheran worship. The tunes, except for those of Sir Arthur Sullivan and perhaps those of Joseph Barnby, both of whom fell under the sway of secular influences, have met the standards of musical expression and have contributed positively to the moods of Lutheran worship, especially in the realm of "The Church Year," and "The Church."

This study is by no means conclusive, since it has been undertaken solely from the theoretical approach. The proof of the conclusion would lie in a thorough study of Lutheran congregations in various localities and of different sizes to ascertain the effectiveness of these tunes in the worship of Lutheran Christians. What the study has shown above all else is the need for further research in this field and further consideration of the importance and function of the hymn tune in general in Lutheran worship.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

American Lutheran Hymnal, Columbus, Ohio, The Lutheran Book Concern, 1930.

APEL, WILLI, Harvard Dictionary of Music, Harvard University Press, 1945.

BARRETT, WILLIAM ALEX, English Church Composers, New York, Scribner and Welford, 1882.

BENSON, LOUIS F., The English Hymn, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1915.

BENSON, LOUIS F., The Hymnody of the Christian Church, New York, George H. Doran Co., 1927.

BREED, DAVID R., History and Use of Hymns and Hymn Tunes, New York, Fleming H. Revell Co., 1903.

BROWN, JAMES DUFF and STRATTON, STEPHEN S., British Musical Biography, Birmingham, Stratton, 1897.

BUMPUS, JOHN S., A History of English Cathedral Music, London, T. W. Laurie, 1908.

BUSZIN, WALTER E., "The Doctrine of the Universal Priesthood and its Influence Upon the Liturgies and Music of the Lutheran Church," The Musical Heritage of the Church, Theodore Heolty-Nickel, Valparaiso, Indiana, 1947.

Common Service Book of the Lutheran Church, Philadelphia, The Board of Publication of the United Lutheran Church in America, 1918.

COVERT, WILLIAM CHALMERS, ed., Handbook to the Hymnal, Philadelphia, Presbyterian Board of Christian Education, 1935.

DAVISON, ARCHIBALD THOMPSON, Protestant Church Music in America, E. C. Schirmer Music Co., 1933.

DICKINSON, EDWARD, Music in the History of the Western Church, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1925.

DOUGLAS, WINFRED, A Brief Commentary on "Selected Hymns and Carols," Chicago, Northwestern University School of Music, 1936.

DOUGLAS, WINFRED, Church Music in History and Practice, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1937.

Evangelical Lutheran Hymn-book, St. Louis, Concordia Publishing House, 1931.

Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, third edition Henry Cope Colles, New York, The Macmillan Co., 1935.

Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, American Supplement, Waldo Selden Pratt, New York, The Macmillan Co., 1938.

Hymnal, The, (Protestant Episcopal), New York, The Church Pension Fund, 1940.

Hymns Ancient and Modern, historical edition, London, Wil-Clowes and Sons, Ltd., 1909.

LANG, PAUL HENRY, Music in Western Civilization, New York, W. W. Norton and Co., Inc., 1941.

LORENZ, EDMUND S., Church Music, New York, Fleming H. Revell Co., 1923.

LUTHER, MARTIN, "Concerning the Ordering of Divine Worship in the Congregation," Works of Martin Luther, Holman edition, Philadelphia, A. J. Holman Co., and the Castle Press, 1932.

Lutheran Hymnal, The, St. Louis, Concordia Publishing House, 1941.

LUTKIN, PETER CHRISTIAN, Music in the Church, Milwaukee, The Young Churchman Co., 1910.

LUTKIN, PETER CHRISTIAN, Ed., Selected Hymns and Carols, Chicago, Northwestern University School of Music, 1930.

MARKS, H. B., Rise and Growth of English Hymnody, New York, Fleming H. Revell and Co., 1937.

McCUTCHAN, ROBERT GUY, Our Hymnody, A Manual of the Methodist Hymnal, New York, The Methodist Book Concern, 1937.

New Baptist Hymnal, Philadelphia, American Baptist Publication Society, 1926.

NUTLER, CHARLES S., and TILLETT, WILBUR F., The Hymns and Hymn Writers, ("The Methodist Hymnal"), New York, Eaton and Mains, 1911.

OXFORD HISTORY OF MUSIC, THE, Percy A. Scholes, VI, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1902.

PARKER, HORATIO, Ed., The Hymnal (Protestant Episcopal), New York, Ewer and Co., 1903.

POLACK, W. G., The Handbook to the Lutheran Hymnal, second and revised edition, St. Louis, Concordia Publishing House, 1942.

PRATT, WALDO SELDEN, Musical Ministries in the Church, New York, G. Schirmer, 1915.

QUALBEN, LARS P., A History of the Christian Church, revised and enlarged, New York, Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1942.

SCHOLES, PERCY A., ed., Oxford Companion to Music, New York, Oxford University Press, 1943.

SMITH, H. AUGUSTINE, "The Expression of Religion in Music," The Arts and Religion, Albert Edward Bailey, New York, The Macmillan Co., 1944.

SMITH, H. AUGUSTINE, Lyric Religion, New York, The Century Co., 1931.

Sunday School Hymnal, St. Louis, Concordia Publishing House, 1901.