4-1-2006

A Pastor and his Ministry: Gregory Thamaturgus' Address of Thanksgiving to Origen as Pastoral Practice

Edwin Harkey
Concordia Seminary, St. Louis, reveddiet@yahoo.com

A PASTOR AND HIS MINISTRY: GREGORY THAMATURGUS' *ADDRESS OF THANKSGIVING TO ORIGEN* AS PASTORAL PRACTICE

A Seminar Paper Presented to the Faculty of
Concordia Seminary, St. Louis,
Department of Historical Theology
in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
Master of Sacred Theology

By
Rev. Edwin T. Harkey
April 1, 2006

Approved by_____
Dr. Quentin Wesselschmidt Advisor

_____
Dr. Timothy Dost Reader

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION 1

1. HISTORICAL INTRODUCTIONS 2

Brief Biography of Gregory, the Wonderworker 2

An Overview of the Works Attributed to Gregory 6

The *Address of Thanksgiving to Origen* 8

2. GREGORY'S ORIGENIST CONNECTION 10

Origen and His Method 11

On Gregory's Relationship to Origen 15

3. SPIRITUAL DIRECTION 18

The Process Defined 18

The Teacher–Student Relationship 21

CONCLUSIONS 25

BIBLIOGRAPHY 30

Veni spiritus, pasce pastorum, duc ducem, aperi aperturo, da daturo, Christe Kyrie, Herr, erbarme dich unser

—Ancient pastoral prayer

Introduction

"Each of us needs companions along the way to offer their help when we cannot help ourselves. We need people who will hold us in prayer when we cannot pray, people whose faith will sustain us in our doubts." So surmises Howard Rice in his book *The Pastor as Spiritual Guide.*[1] It is just one in a number of recent offerings on the subject of spiritual direction and formation, which would seem to indicate a rise of interest in spirituality and, more specifically, the care and cure of souls. In their book *Spiritual Direction and the Care of Souls: A Guide to Christian Approaches and Practices,* Gary W. Moon and David G. Benner assume that "few would have ever even heard of the concepts of spiritual formation or direction until recently," summarizing ancient and recent approaches to the subject, and offering up to "interdisciplinary dialogue and ecumenical openness" what is one of the latest contributions to this field of study.[2] What is apparent from these and other contributions is what was of great interest to the Christian church in antiquity is now being reexamined once again in light of more modern fields of study such as psychotherapy and pastoral counseling: spiritual direction and formation as an integrated whole, taking into consideration the whole person and his or her world. This is nothing new to the church, evidenced by those in the church's early history who valued and appropriated for their own use the various methods of conveying the truths of nature and faith so prominent among the Greeks.

One such student of his times was Origen. In his writings we see glimpses that while his goal

---

[1] Howard Rice, *The Pastor as Spiritual Guide* (Nashville: Upper Room Books, 1998), 48.

[2] Gary W. Moon and David G. Benner, eds., *Spiritual Direction and the Care of Souls: A Guide to Christian Approaches and Practices* (Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 2004).

was ultimately a deeply spiritual one—no less than a union with the Divine—he seemed no stranger to a more holistic approach in his encounters with the students who placed themselves under his tutelage. One of those students, Gregory Thaumaturgus, often called the "Wonderworker," even bequeathed to the church a most revealing document that enables us to get a rare glimpse of Origen and his method and style. It is that document, Gregory's *Address of Thanksgiving to Origen*, that will be the subject of this paper.

For my purposes, the greater goal will be to discern whether Origen's method of discipling his students fits the category of what would be considered spiritual direction and the care of souls. To what degree does this method contribute to a pastor's overall view of his own office, and the practice of what has traditionally been understood as the care of souls? Gregory offers up some wonderful insights regarding his teacher and "friend." In so doing, he opens a window to past patterns of spiritual direction and formation, with a possible view to the present.

CHAPTER ONE

HISTORICAL INTRODUCTIONS

Brief Biography of Gregory, the Wonderworker

"Even now there is still a great admiration for this man among the local inhabitants, and his memory, always fresh and always green, is planted among the churches and does not wither away through time."[3] So writes Basil to the clergy of Neocaesarea (a metropolis of the Roman province of Pontus), appealing to the growing cultus of Gregory the Wonderworker in the latter quarter of the fourth century. In fact, we have any number of accounts of Gregory, more or less complete, in antiquity.[4] Yet it is primarily Eusebius of Caesarea, Gregory of Nyssa, and

[3] *Ep.* 207, in Raymond van Dam, "Hagiography and History: The Life of Gregory Thaumaturgus," *Classical Antiquity* 1 (1982):287.

[4] Eusebius (*HE,* vi.30, vii.14); Nyssa (*Life of Gregory the Wonderworker*); Basil (*De Spiritu Sancto,* xxix.74; *Epist.* 28.1,2; 204.2; 207.4; 210.3,5); Jerome (*De viris illstr.* 65; *Comm. in Eccl.* 4; *Epist.* 70.4); Rufinus *(continued next page)*

Thaumaturgus himself who give us a most complete account of his life, though unfortunately in Nyssa's case it is painstakingly difficult to accurately distinguish between fact and fiction.[5]

What do we know about the Wonderworker with some accuracy? Born in Cappadocia sometime between 210 and 215, Gregory began studying rhetoric and Latin around the age of fourteen. His greater goal was the study of Roman law, a "privilege which he recalls with all the pride of a man sent first-class at official expense."[6] In fact, it was at Rome's expense that the next dramatic turn for Gregory would occur, probably around 233, when Gregory accompanied his sister to Berytus so that she could join her husband, who was a Roman official. It was here that Gregory began his five-year tutelage under his "Gamaliel," at which time he seems to have been converted to the faith and baptized. The timing, as well as the subsequent impact that this meeting had on Gregory, he owed to Providence. It would be his own "divine pedagogue and

---

(*HE,* vii.25); Socrates (*HE,* iv.27); Sozomen (*HE,* vii.27); and Evagrius Scholasticus (*HE,* iii.31). For Eusebius, see *The Church History: A New Translation with Commentary,* trans. Paul L. Maier (Grand Rapids: Kregel, 1999); for Nyssa, *St. Gregory Thaumaturgus, Life and Works*, The Fathers of the Church, vol. 98, trans. Michael Slusser (Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 1998); for Basil, *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, vol. 6, eds. Rev. Alexander Roberts and James Donaldson, (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, Repr. 1987).

[5] For critical yet helpful examinations of Nyssa's contribution to what is known or not about Gregory, see Robin Lane Fox, *Pagans and Christians in the Mediterranean World from the Second Century A.D. to the Conversion of Constantine* (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1988), 516–42; William Telfer, "The Cultus of St. Gregory Thaumaturgus," *Harvard Theological Review* 29 (1936):225–344; Stephen Mitchell, "The Life and *Lives* of Gregory Thaumaturgus," *Portraits of Spiritual Authority: Religious Power in Early Christianity, Byzantium and the Christian Orient*, eds. Jan Willem Drijvers and John W. Watt (Leiden: Brill, 1999), 99–138; Raymond van Dam, 272 –308. Though seemingly an "important component of the dossier on Gregory" (Slusser, 14), it is Nyssa's panegyric that more than likely gave rise to Gregory's "wonder-worker" status, if not outright inventing it (Telfer, 229). While Mitchell sees the work's primary goal of establishing or reestablishing Trinitarian theology in Neocaesarea (as being encapsulated in the purported *Creed* of Gregory), and van Dam sees "an exercise in the methodology of writing history based on oral and hagiographical sources" with the intent "to define topics and approaches for consideration" (277), most come to the same conclusion that while Nyssa's contribution to what we know about Gregory is to be applauded, it must be read with a severely critical eye. For Fox, what we have in these stories is not Gregory's own history, but Nyssa's, stories that while Christianizing "the local landscape . . . are not evidence for their hero's true character" (531f.). "At all points where this account can be measured against information profiled in Gregory's own works, it is found wanting" (Mitchell, 120).

[6] Fox, 519. Alexander Roberts and James Donaldson rather fancifully contend that this "mother and nurse of civil law . . . indirectly owes its origin . . . to the new powers and processes of thought which came from 'the Light of the Word.' It was light from Galilee and Golgotha, answering Pilate's question in the inward convictions of many a heathen sage" (4).

true guardian, ever alert" who would see him on to Caesarea and Origen, and home again.[7]

At the conclusion of his time with Origen—a parting he greatly mourns—Gregory returned to Neocaesarea, at first to live somewhat of an ascetic life, but subsequently he was appointed bishop of Neocaesarea by Phaidimos, then bishop of the metropolis of Cappadocian Pontus. As surmised by Michael Slusser, Gregory "maintained that leadership through the persecution of Decius in 250-251 . . . and the incursions of Goths into the region in 257,"[8] and he was, according to Eusebius, later present at a synod in Antioch in 264 to lend his aid in addressing the issues surrounding Paul of Samosata.[9] Chronologically, not much else is known about Gregory with certainty, with the traditional date of his death being placed sometime between 270 and 275.

That in the course of time Gregory grew to "Wonderworker" status, particularly in the Cappadocian region, is due, in no small part, to Nyssa's *Life of Gregory*. This *Life* is partially drawn from genuine memories handed down by Macrina the elder, the mother of both Nyssa and Basil.[10] It is she who claims to have known Gregory personally, out of which grew the inflated stories that are captured in Nyssa's work.[11] However, "the nickname Thaumaturgos only begins

---

[7] *Address of Thanksgiving to Origen,* 5.57. For this and all subsequent quotes from Gregory, I will be using Michael Slusser's translation of *St. Gregory, Thaumaturgis: Life and Works*. For what Mitchell in "The Life and *Lives* of Gregory Thaumaturgus," deems "biographically the most important section" (101) of that *Address,* see paragraph 5. There, in part, Gregory writes of his "conversion": "Like a spark landed in the middle of our soul, the love for the most attractive Word of all, holy and most desirable in its ineffable beauty, and for this man who is his friend and confidant, was kindled and fanned into flame. Gravely wounded by it, I was persuaded to neglect all the affairs or studies for which we seemed destined, including even my precious law, and my native land and friends, those back home and those we were to visit. Just one thing seemed dear and beloved to me, the life of philosophy and this divine human being, its chief exponent" (5.83). For other analysis of Gregory's conversion, see Ramsey MacMullen, *Christianizing the Roman Empire, A.D. 100–400* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1984), 59–61; and Joseph Trigg, "God's Marvelous *Oikonomia*: Reflections of Origen's Understanding of Divine and Human Pedagogy in the Address Ascribed to Gregory," *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 9 (Spring 2001):35.

[8] Slusser, 2.

[9] *HE* 7.28.1.

[10] See Basil, *Ep.* 206.6, as well as other biographical data noted in his other epistles referenced above.

[11] A brief summary of these stories from Nyssa's panegyric are as follows: a prostitute who accused Gregory of cheating her out of her wages, whereupon receiving the money she was inhabited by a demon, by which Gregory then prayed for her deliverance (2.15ff.); his visitation by the apostle John and Mary—in order to instruct him in the way of the Orthodox faith . . . thus leaving him the Creed that bears his name (4.29ff.); driving out demons in a

(continued next page)

with many quotations found in the *Refutation of Chalcedon* of Timothy Aeluros before 477."[12] In more modern times, Gregory has been seen as "protector against plague, earthquake and the baleful power of demons in general," as well as the patron saint to the Christians in Bosnia.[13] His *Address* is still often read on his feast day, which is November 17.

Perhaps Nyssa offers us the most fitting summary of Gregory's life and death:

> But let it be said of my life in times to come that Gregory was not named for someplace while he lived, and after death rested in strangers' graves, keeping himself from every earthly possession to the point of not even receiving burial in his

---

pagan temple, thus rendering them unable to reenter, and then placing a written piece of paper on the altar with this inscription: "Gregory to Satan: Enter!" to invite them back in (5.34ff.); the ensuing conversion of the temple priest and removal of a large bolder (5.40); by sundown of that day, winning enough converts to form a congregation (6.47); building a church, which would miraculously survive an earthquake when the rest of the city was destroyed (6.48); drying up a lake when two brothers could not decide on how to divide the inheritance (7.51ff.); rerouting a river that had wreaked devastation on a certain people by planting his staff which became a tree . . . "a memorial of Gregory's grace and power preserved for all time" (8.56ff.); seemingly hoodwinked by a couple of men trying to scam Gregory out of money, he throws his cloak on the man as if dead . . . but then the man actually dies (10.73ff); healing a possessed boy (11.77); miraculously disguising himself, thus evading those who would put him to death when the edict had been given by the emperor (probably Decius) to persecute the Christians (12.84ff.); casting out a demon in the bathhouse (13.92f.). Gregory, by word and deed, carried out the duties of his office so well that upon entering his field of service only seventeen Christians could be found; by ministry's end, only seventeen pagans! (cf. 3.27). About these stories, Nyssa himself writes: "The wonders done by the one being commemorated have in no way been embellished by invention, but that the remembrance of the facts in this regard suffices for the most perfect eulogy, like natural facial beauty unadorned by any cunning of cosmetic art (6.46) . . . To go through in order all the marvels worked by him would require a long book and a discourse exceeding the time we have now." (11.78). Clearly, "the demands of form seem to have taken precedence over concern for historical reliability" (van Damm, 280). See Mitchell, 124, for some possible reasons that might give rise to such stories as these. One final whimsical thought: "But why make it his opprobrium? He is not responsible for the romances that sprung up after his death; which he never heard nor imagined. Like the great Friar Bacon, who was considered a magician, or Faust, whose invention nearly cost him his life, the reputation of Gregory made him the subject of legendary lore long after he was gone. It is not impossible that God wrought marvels by his hand, but a single instance would give rise to many fables; and this very surname is of itself a monument of the fact that miracles were now of rare occurrence, and that one possessing the gift was a wonder to his contemporaries" (Alexander and Roberts, 5).

[12] Michael Van Esbroeck, "The *Credo* of Gregory the Wonderworker and Its Influence through Three Centuries," *Studia Patristica*, vol. 19, ed.,Elizabeth A. Livingstone (Leuven: Peeters, 1989), 262. He notes that Rufinus, Jerome, and Socrates each speak only of "Gregory." Eusebius adds "the famous one," and Sozomonos, "the remarkable one." Nyssa, Gregory of Nazianzus, and Basil all use "Gregory the Great."

[13] Telfer, "The Cultus of St. Gregory Thaumaturgus," 230, and Slusser, 13, fn. 52, who also succinctly offers a host of other scholarly attempts at the chronology of Gregory's life and work (5f., fn. 26). Telfer, after masterfully tracing the cultus of Gregory down through the ages, even to his "presence" in the *Hagia Sophia*, surmises: "Today the cult of the Thaumaturge has no longer a centre in his own city. There are no distinguishable ruins of the church to be seen. And his very name has only survived locally in the dedications of one or two chapels and village churches in the neighbourhood. Since the Great War (WW II) it is probable that not a trace of the memory of the apostle of Pontus remains in the land" (236f.).

own place. For his only possession would be that honor which does not bear within it any trace of selfishness.[14]

An Overview of the Works Attributed to Gregory

The debate regarding the various writings of Gregory is nicely summarized in Slusser's recent scholarly edition and translation of Gregory's works. There Slusser takes what he calls a "maximalist" view, giving Gregory the benefit of the doubt on many works attributed to him, but clearly discounting others that, for various reasons, could not have come from Gregory's pen.[15] As there was not a collection of manuscripts during Gregory's lifetime, much has been attributed to him, that has from time to time appeared in different collections by various authors. Those that we do possess with certainty are widely accepted.

Among those works, *The Address of Thanksgiving to Origen* is clearly one of the most well-attested. Along with this is the *Canonical Epistle*, written circa 257. This letter, the authority of which was recognized by the second Council of Trullo in 692 and that serves as one of the foundational documents of the Orthodox Church, tried to address some of the issues confronting the church with the incursion of the Goths into northern Asia Minor.[16] To say the least, the issues of Christians being forced to eat pagan foods, of women being raped, and how to deal pastorally with all of the Christians who had in some way profited from the invasions, dealt a confusing blow to the Pontic churches. Gregory's letter, which deals forthrightly with these issues, is authoritative, but pastoral in tone. The result that the letter had on its unnamed

---

[14] *Life*, 15.98. Earlier Nyssa writes: "Just as Scripture says about Moses, 'He was schooled in all the wisdom of the Egyptians,' so also the Great One, coming through all the schooling of the Greeks and knowing by experience the weakness and incoherence of their doctrines, came to be a disciple of the gospel, and even before being initiated through the mystical and incorporeal birth, he so perfected his life that he brought no stain of sin to the baptismal cleansing." (2.13); Cf. Philip Schaff, *History of the Christian Church*, vol. 2 (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 1965), who writes: "Deducting all these marvelous features, which the magnifying distance of one century after the death of the saint created, there remains the commanding figure of a great and good man who made a most powerful impression upon his and the subsequent generations" (800).

[15] For a more detailed listing of authentic and spurious works by various authors, see Slusser, 4f.

[16] Slusser, 27.

addressee or recipients is unknown.[17]

Three other works are also attributed to Gregory with certainty. His *Metaphrase on the Ecclesiastes of Solomon, To Philagrius on Consubstantiality,* and *To Theopompus on the Impassibility and Passibility of God* are each believed to be genuine. A *protrepticus,* or "appeal to its readers to take up the philosophical life with full seriousness,"[18] Gregory's *Metaphrase*, perhaps written during his time with Origen, celebrates the philosophical and virtuous life. Addressing matters such as wisdom, temperance, self-control, modesty, and the overall "passion-less" life, the clear goal for Gregory is union with God and true piety, classic components of Eastern spirituality.[19] *To Philagrius,* at times attributed to both Gregrory Nazianzus and Nyssa, addresses the basic question "Is the divine nature simple or composite—given the attribution of the several names of Father, Son and Holy Spirit to God?"[20] *To Theopompus* is a philosophical treatise, in the form of a dialogue that deals with the idea of suffering within the Godhead. This work characterizes Gregory as more of an apologist than a "charismatic worker of miracles."[21]

Though offering no real help in addressing the subject of pastoral theology or spiritual direction, it is primarily these works that have informed various studies of Gregory's theology,

---

[17] For setting the historical context of this letter, see Fox, 539ff., and Herwig Wolfram, *History of the Goths,* trans. Thomas J. Dunlap (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), 43–52.

[18] Slusser, 24.

[19] More specifically, the moral life is tantamount to "union with God through true piety as the goal; the traditional moral virtues, especially detachment from possessions; the value of companions in the moral life; appreciation of withdrawal from the hurly-burly of public life; and the overall direction provided by the Logos of God." Michael Slusser, "The Main Ethical Emphases in the Writings of Gregory Thaumaturgus," *Studia Patristica,* vol. 31, ed. Elizabeth A. Livingstone (Leuven: Peeters, 1997), 357–62. See also Kenneth Noakes, "The Metaphrase on Ecclesiastes of Gregory Thaumaturgus," *Studia Patristica,* vol. 15.1. ed. Elizabeth Livingstone (Leuven: Peeters, 1984), 194–97; and John Jarick, *Gregory Thaumaturgos' Paraphrase of Ecclesiastes* (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1990). For an eventual progression of this ethical teaching, see Robert Thompson, *The Teaching of St. Gregory: An Early Armenian Catechism* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1970). For the thought of Gregory himself, *Address* 4.35–36 and 6.73–92.

[20] Michael Slusser, "The 'To Philagrius on Consubstantiality' of Gregory Thaumaturgus," *Studia Patristica,* vol. 19, ed. Elizabeth A. Livingstone (Leuven: Peeters, 1989), 231.

[21] Fox, 539.

summarized nicely by Slusser and Crouzel.[22] Other works attributed to Gregory are his purported *Creed,* a *Letter of Origen to Gregory*, a *Glossary on Ezekiel,* and a work entitled *To Tatian on the Soul.* The *Creed* can ultimately be traced to Nyssa's panegyric and is more than likely a composition of Nyssa himself.[23] The *Letter of Origen to Gregory*, a part of the *Philocalia,* is basically an encouragement to Gregory from his teacher to continue in his pursuit of the philosophical life, but "as ancillary to the earnest and prayerful study of theology and the Scriptures."[24]

The *Address of Thanksgiving to Origen*

Written circa 238, *The Address* is by far the most celebrated work of Gregory. It takes the form of an address that appears to have been delivered at the time of Gregory's departure from Origen's school in Caesarea. "At its most elementary level [the *Address*] describes his teacher: *how* he understood his teacher and gave expression to that understanding; *how* his teacher taught him and in what order."[25] Not a panegyric in its literary form, it is a magnificently celebrated example of the humility and respect with which one approaches his or her teacher. It is written

---

[22] Slusser, *St. Gregory Thaumaturgus, Life and Works*, 10ff. See also Henri Crouzel, ed. and trans. *Remerciement a Origene, suivi de la Lettre d'Origene a Gregoire,* Sources Chretiennes, vol. 148 (Paris: Cerf, 1969), 46–78.

[23] Nyssa, *Life,* 4.32, where the origin of the Creed itself is traced to a revelation from St. John and Mary directly to Gregory. Mitchell sees the Creed as the major reason for Nyssa's *Life* (128). It is probably much less a "forgery" (Roberts and Donaldson, 4) than an expanded creedal formula that went through some hefty revision. Mitchell concludes: "Furthermore, the theological spirit of the Creed is precisely in tune with the efforts of the leaders of the eastern churches to find a creedal formula, which updated Nicene orthodoxy with contemporary trinitiarian thinking" (111f.; for the full discussion see, 108–16). Schaff deems it "a most explicit statement of the doctrine of the Trinity from the ante-Nicene age" and "a Greek anticipation of the Latin *Quicunque*" (798f.). See also van Esbroeck.

[24] Marrotta and William Charles Metcalfe, *Gregory Thaumaturgus. Address to Origen* (London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1920), 37. On *Tatian,* A. Whealey, "'To Tatian on the Soul': A Treatise from the Circle of Tatian the Syrian and Justin Martyr?" *Recherches de theologie ancienne et medievale* 63 (1996):136–45.

[25] Richard Valantasis, *Spiritual Guides of the Third Century* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991), 15. Trigg, quoting Crouzel, notes that this is "the oldest surviving oration by a Christian that is not a homily and one of the only two surviving testimonies by students to their teachers in late antiquity" (28). "The other, written a few decades later, is Porphyry's *Life of Plotinus*; since Porphyry himself testifies to having met Origen during his youth, the two authors may even have known one another" (28). Cf. Eusebius, *EH* 6.9.15.

with deep respect both for the teacher and for the way in which Origen seemingly brought Gregory to the faith. As will be noted below, this was all God's doing—ordained as such, with Gregory acknowledging in a conscientious way that God's providence was behind it all. In so doing, Gregory also gives us one of the most detailed insights into the nature of Origen's method of teaching.

A brief outline of the *Address* is as follows:

Beginning with an exhortation (1–30) in which Gregory lists the various reasons for giving, or not, his address, he moves into the historical account of how he came to be in Origen's presence (31–72). Next is how Origen courted and cajoled Gregory as a student (73–92), followed by the actual method by which Origen taught him, his brother, and others (93–81). In the closing sections he offers his regrets in having to leave Origen and return to his "exile" (182–202), asking finally for Origen's blessing and prayers as he returns home (203–207). What lies at the heart of the *Address* is the account of Origen's teaching, a teaching that centers on dialectics (99–108), physics, the study of natural phenomena of which geometry and astronomy formed a part (109–114), a study in ethics (115–149), and theology (150–181).[26]

As to style, Gregory "never uses one word when fourteen will do."[27] One such example is Gregory's comparison of the dangers of holding fast to a single philosophy. He speaks of this misguided thought in terms of being mired in an impassable swamp, of being lost in a dense forest where each possible way out turns out to be deceptive, and of being caught in a labyrinth whose passages are designed to mislead and confuse (14.166ff.). Another example comes at the end of the *Address*, where Gregory compares his separation from Origen to Adam being expelled

---

[26] See Trigg, 28f., especially for a further developing of these categories as they are found in Origen's *Song of Songs* and *Commentary on Lamentations.*

[27] Trigg, 29. Quoting Eugenio Marotta, "I neolgismi nell' orazione ad Origene di Gregorio il Taumaturgo," *VetC* 8 (1971):241–56, 309–17: "He was astonishingly fertile in finding recondite terms for inventing his own."

from Eden, the prodigal son found in a far country, the Israelites led into captivity in Babylon, and a man who fell among thieves (15.183-17.200). Though clearly avoiding what might be deemed "Christian" terminology, Gregory's grasp of Scripture is quite evident, if not "artful and pervasive."[28]

That Gregory was a Christian, however, is clearly evident. In a most profound passage he speaks a most reflective and weighty word of praise to that

> one who heals our weakness and who alone is able to make up our shortcomings, our souls' champion and Savior, [God's] first-begotten Word, the demiurge and Pilot of all things. He alone can send up continuous and unfailing thanksgiving to the Father for himself and for the universe, each individually and all together. He is the truth, and both the wisdom and the power of the Father of the universe himself, and is also with and in him and united to him completely . . . He alone is able to fulfill most perfectly the full worth of the praises he deserves (4.35-37).

That Gregory's spiritual formation took at least five years is a clear signal to both pastors and those whom they disciple that a sense of commitment to the process of spiritual direction and formation is necessary for it to thrive. That it "worked" in Gregory's case seems most evident when we explore a little further the relationship Gregory had with his teacher, Origen.

CHAPTER TWO

GREGORY'S ORIGENIST CONNECTION

Clearly, from the *Address,* the most celebrated aspect of Gregory's life and works is his connection to his teacher—Origen.[29] And while it is far beyond the scope of this paper to give a detailed testimony of the person and works of Gregory's "divine pedagogue," it is important for

---

[28] Trigg, 30, quoting Marotta, "I riflessi biblici nell'orazione ad Origene di Gregorio il Taumaturgo," *VetC* 10 (1973):59–77. On the issue of Gregory's avoidance of Scripture, Trigg notes other Christian authors who also did so, namely, Athenagoras, *Plea,* Clement of Alexandria, *Exhortation,* Theophilus of Antioch, *To Autolycus*—with the last named discussing "the meaning of the word 'Christian' without mentioning Jesus Christ." Trigg concludes: "Seen in the light of such precedents, Gregory's *Address* does not seem quite so strange as the product of a student of Origen" (33).

[29] In fact, it is Gregory's *Address* that is cited by Crouzel as one of the main sources for the life of Origen that we have. See Crouzel, *Origen,* 1f. (and fn. 3). The others are Eusebius, *EH*; *Apology for Origen,* by Pamphilus: and *Bibliotheca* of Photius.

this study to explore and make some conclusions regarding Origen's manner and method of teaching. It is for these things that Gregory ultimately sings his teacher's praises, features which inform what is equated with spiritual direction today.

Origen and His Method

Athens and Jerusalem: how do they coexist in the sense that one can be schooled in the philosophy of the Greeks and translate it into a theology that is faithful to the Scriptures? Gregory was one example of this coexistence. Origen would later encourage his "son" to "pay attention to the reading of the divine Scriptures, but do apply yourself. We need great application when we are reading divine things, so that we may not be impetuous in saying or understanding anything concerning them."[30]

What Gregory learned, he learned from Origen. Out of his own mouth, Origen characterizes both his own reluctance to be *anyone's* teacher and his willingness, upon assuming that role, to do so with great care and skill. Commenting on Matthew 24:45, "Who then is the faithful and wise servant, whom his lord has made ruler over his household to give them meat in due season?" Origen writes:

> Given the great number of christians, one ought to exercise great caution not to impart the reasonable and spiritual food to companions of any quality whatsoever and to whom one should not; for there are some who are in greater need of moral edification for the betterment of their life, than of knowledge and wisdom. To others, by contrast, one should not feel reluctant to expand higher things. To the one who is faithful and wise both the one and the other are difficult, but not impossible.[31]

Both Gregory and Eusebius fill in a few of the details, illuminating the ministry and the method of Origen. "I have the intention of speaking about a man, or about someone who seems

---

[30] Origen, *Letter to Gregory,* in Trigg, 4.

[31] Quoted in *Spiritual Direction in the Early Christian East,* Irenee Hausherr (Kalamazoo: Cistercian Publications, 1990), 2. For additional gems on Origen as the "erudite pastor," see Philip L. Culbertson and Arthur Bradford Shippee, eds., *The Pastor: Readings from the Patristic Period* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1990), 30–43.

and appears to be a man, but to those capable of seeing the extent of his condition, he has already finished with the human condition in order to arrive at a better situation in his migration to divinity," Gregory wrote at the outset of his *Address* (2.10). To which Eusebius would concur, there was something indeed special about this man. Finding most of the material for his *History* at the library in Caesarea, founded by Origen, Eusebius recalls Origen's youth and "his firm foundation in the faith, based on study of the divine Scriptures . . . not satisfied to read the sacred words in a simple and literal sense but [seeking] something more . . . worrying his father with questions regarding the inner meaning of inspired Scripture . . . keeping the rule of the church from boyhood and loathing all heretical teachings."[32] At the age of 18, Origen, "whose deeds matched his words and his words his deeds . . . became head of the catechetical school (in Alexandria) . . . living the philosophic life with arduous tasks by day but spending most of the night studying the divine Scriptures."[33]

Eusebius continues:

> Origen was teaching at Caesarea, many students, both local and from many foreign countries, studied under him. The most distinguished among these were Theodore—who was none other than the acclaimed bishop of my own day, Gregory—and his brother Athenodore. Both were strongly engrossed in Greek and Roman studies, but Origen instilled in them a love of philosophy and convinced them to exchange their

---

[32] *EH,* 6.2.

[33] *EH,* 6.3. That there was even such a "school" per se or that the curriculum was such that it could be easily characterized seems open to some debate. Much of this thought is owed to Adolf Knauber, "Dan Anliegen der Schule des Origenes zu Caesarea," *Munchener theologische Zeitschrift* 19 (1968):182–302, who writes: "The school of Origen . . . was an essentially propagandistic—more exactly philosophical/missionary—endeavor. . . . It neither arose from a speculative-theological demand within the faith nor filled in any direct way practical sacramental and pastoral tasks for the community" (in Slusser, *Life and Works,* 19f. and fn. 78). Crouzel concurs, concluding: "It is not correct to describe Origen's school at Caesarea as a 'catechetical school,' still less as a faculty of theology. ... Following A. Knauber we think that the school of Caesarea was more of a kind of missionary school, aimed at young pagans who were showing an interest in Christianity but were not ready, necessarily, to ask for baptism. Origen was thus introducing these to Christian doctrine through a course in philosophy, mainly inspired by Middle Platonism, of which he offered them a Christian version. If his students later asked to become Christians, they had then to receive catechetical teaching in the strict sense. But the *didascaleion* [school] of Caesarea is above all a school of the inner life: all its teaching leads to spirituality" (*Origen,* 27f.). See also Metcalfe, 7–41, who concludes: "When we come to Origen's assumption of the headship of the school we are as far as ever from attaining much light on its organization. So far from this, we find everything utterly disorganized" (15). For the basic curriculum for study, see Gregory, *Address,* 6.15ff.

> previous passion for theological study. They continued with him for five years and made such progress in theology that while both were still young they were elected bishops of the churches in Pontus.[34]

Origen was eventually persecuted under Decius, dying circa 254 at the age of 69, but not before soliciting this response from Gregory: "He is the only person now living, whom I know personally or by reputation, who is accustomed to receive in his soul pure and luminous oracles and to teach them to others" (15.174f). These statements are not mere rhetoric.[35]

In fact, what these passages describe is a connection that goes far beyond what might be described as the *normal* pastor-to-parishioner relationship, at least as it might be commonly practiced and understood today, but one which perhaps serves as a model for that relationship. What specifically was Origen's method?

"A renegade philosopher," Origen was well-schooled and at home in the philosophical world from whence he came. In fact, "there can be no religion, properly speaking, without philosophy," as philosophy for Origen, confirmed by Gregory in his *Address,* becomes a portal into theology.[36] Origen himself writes: "Happy are they who no longer need the Son as Physician, nor Shepherd, nor Redemption, but as Wisdom and Word and Righteousness." [37] Without question, Origen's ultimate goal was to lead his students into union with the Divine, but "with an amiable, philanthropic and very kindly intention" he would accomplish this by making his students into "sharers of the good things from philosophy" (6.82).

Origen's specific method consists more of dictation than being literary in form, though he is said to have written six thousand volumes![38] Presenting alternatives, though not necessarily

---

[34] *EH,* 6.30.

[35] Trigg, 41.

[36] Metcalfe, 21f.

[37] *In Joannem,* i. 22, in Metcalfe, 27.

[38] Eusebius writes: "His great enthusiasm for theology was the most powerful stimulus to Origen's composing

(continued next page)

formulating clear and certain conclusions, Crouzel comments that "Origen's procedure can be compared to that of a professor of philosophy who tries to present to his students different doctrines with all their implications and in all their force even if he personally holds yet another view or has not decided on any."[39] According to the *Address,* this was precisely Origen's way with Gregory, except when it came to reading the "atheists"! Origen himself states that the teacher must discern "the appropriate time for introducing (certain) doctrines, so as to not harm the person listening and to calibrate carefully what is to be left out or added, even when he observes the appropriate time."[40]

That he did this with some authority and command seems beyond question. Furthermore, that his method included a total integration and immersion of the student with his world is evident, not only by the broad range of subjects with which Origen sought to acquaint his students, but also by his propensity for unifying theory and practice. He was, in every way, a "guide" to those under his care, as he sought to clarify their world and quietly help them to discern the voice of God as He spoke.[41] Gregory writes:

---

the *Commentaries*" (6.23; cf. 6.24f. for a list of them). See Metcalfe, who sees these dictations as "a fact which accounts for many peculiarities of his style, its repetitions, its abrupt transition, its equally abrupt resumption, and additions" (19).

[39] *Origen,* 166.

[40] *Commentary on John* 20.1.7, in Trigg, 49. See also Slusser, *Life and Works,* who notes: "It is possible that Origen's Alexandrian teaching also had this open-ended, scarcely 'Christian' character, and thus competed more openly and directly with Gnostic teachers than his superiors in Alexandria were willing to countenance" (21). Cf. Eusebius, *EH* 6.19.

[41] Cf. Metcalfe, who states that Origen's method can be seen "in Socratic fashion on exactness of definition and clear apprehension of an argument . . . tripping up an adversary . . . for their benefit . . . to encourage exactness of thought and expression." Origen then led his students "on to the consideration of the outer world, raising them from an unreasoning wonder and astonishment to a reasoned admiration of the world in its component parts and in its organization" . . . using geometry and astronomy . . . "presenting the former as the sure and unquestionable foundation of all things, and forming with the other a ladder reaching up to the heavens" (29f.). Valantasis notes: "The teacher's ability to understand God as God speaks and to teach human beings as they listen manifests the immediacy of the teacher's relationship to God. This represents a mutual and immediate participation of teacher in God, and student in teacher, so that the interpretation of the oracles of God becomes a sign of the intimate and continuing communion which the teacher shares with God" (24). In the *Letter concerning Ambrose*, we have this additional "complaint": "We scarcely have time for meals amid our discussions, nor when we have supped, for a

(continued next page)

> He was constraining us, if one should say so, to act justly by the soul's proper activity to which he persuaded us to apply ourselves, he turned us aside from a life of many business affairs and of the tumultuous public square, exciting us to examine ourselves and to occupy ourselves with things that really matter . . . For what else could be more appropriate of the soul and what else more worthy than to take care of itself, not looking outside, engaging in the business of others, nor, so to speak, bringing the greatest injury to itself, but turning inward toward itself, to devote itself to itself and thus to do itself justice? (11.138ff.)

From this particular method, Gregory clearly "understood Origen as an active participant in God's salvific work," and that work as a very real participation in the divine economy of God.[42] As a bit is to a wild horse (7.97), all the while in pursuit of "the knowledge of the cause of everything" (13.150), for Gregory, "behind the teacher is a guardian angel paedagogue, and behind the philosophical teacher is a divine man."[43] That this man and his method suited Gregory well is made evident in the glowing terms with which he portrays his teacher, thus describing for us in antiquity a friendship not unlike that of an Elijah to Elisha, David to Jonathan, or Paul to Timothy.

On Gregory's Relationship to Origen

Gregory in his *Address* credits his spiritual formation to four individuals: his parents (5.48), his rhetor (5.56), his law teacher (5.59), and that "holy man"—Origen (5.63). Commenting on the influence of each of these, Richard Valantasis notes: "Each one has its own specific

---

walk, or rest to our bodies. Even then we have to discuss points of grammar and check MSS. We cannot even give our frames the benefit of a full night's sleep, for we pursue our grammatical discussions until far into the evening. I say nothing about the time from the dawn till the ninth or tenth hour: for all serious students devote those hours to the study and reading of the divine oracles" (Metcalfe, 20). For more on Origen's own understanding of his role, see Trigg, 46ff., and Origen himself: *Homilies on Luke* 19.6 and *Commentary on John* 32.10.111ff.

[42] Valantasis, 34f. This is also the basic thesis of Trigg's article.

[43] Valantasis, 22, who notes a connection to Plato's *Symposium*. On the five elements of Origen's character: "The teacher begins as a human being who is totally human and mortal. Through hard work, labor, preparation, practice, the teacher 'packs up and leaves' his moral state and appearance in order to take on a more 'apparent and seeming humanity' through migration toward God. The migration removes the humanlike aspects of birth, beauty and strength, and heightens the more godlike attributes of his being. The teacher thus becomes like God, and like God is able to attract and compel students/people. None of this, however, is readily apparent, except to those whose ability to see enables them to apprehend the divinized status of the teacher."

educational orientation, performed under the guidance of the guardian angel." This angel, which "stands as a sign of the spiritual significance of formation . . . spiritualizes educational formation by directing the significance away from the merely paedagogic."[44] For Gregory, it was this angel that brought him to the feet of his "Gamaliel," where "from the very first day of his receiving us," he says, "the true sun began to rise on me" (6.73).

It is from Gregory's own lips that we begin to see the true nature of his relationship to his teacher, as he gives us images of Origen as "teacher" (4.40; 6.78), "friend" (6.81ff.; 6.85ff.), and a veritable "Paradise." (15.183). Gregory writes:

> And indeed he sank into us the spur of friendship (not easily resisted but sharp and most effective) and of courtesy and good disposition; his kind attitude toward us showed in his very tones as he addressed us and conversed with us. He was not trying to bewilder us with words anyway; his purpose was honest and benevolent and helpful, to save us and make us participants in the good things of the philosophic life, and even more in those with which God has endowed him more than most, or perhaps even anyone in our time: namely, the saving Word, the Teacher of true piety (6.81f.).

Origen himself quotes a former Jew who once told him that "Scripture was like a house full of locked rooms: God, he said, had confused the keys, and it was up to his heirs to fit the right key to each lock."[45] Gregory's guide through this maze, his "savior" (19.204), was not a perfect example of a spiritual director or teacher "but was very anxious to become one: he drove himself, one might say, with all his zeal and his ardour, beyond the limits of human strength" (11.136).[46]

As noted above, the relationship was also seen in light of the friendship of David to Jonathan (6.81-92). Where, at this point, the implications for the *Address* as pastoral practice dramatically

---

[44] Valantasis, 18.

[45] *Sel. in Ps.*, in Fox, 524.

[46] "Man of steel: such is Origen by reason of his total devotion to his task, intellectual and apostolic, and by reason of the way in which his life was consistent with his teaching" (Crouzel, *Origen,* 52).

surface, foreshadowing "the Cappadocians' (pastors in their own right) own experiments with a spiritual community."[47] Speaking of Origen's friendship, courtesy, honesty, benevolence, and true piety, one could not imagine better qualities with which a pastor would carry out the task of shepherding his flock. While the normal terms for this relationship in Lutheran circles would not be seen in terms of a superior to an inferior, or a greater to a lesser type of bond as in the *Address* (6.89), the fact that a bond is formed between a pastor and his people cannot be denied, especially for one who takes such great care in cultivating a knowledge of his sheep. Gregory writes: "By such constraints *this* David, having bound us, holds us now as ever since that time, nor even if we wished could we be freed from his bonds. Not even if we should move away will he let go our souls, since he holds them thus 'knit,' to use the terms of holy Scripture" (6.92).

Gregory then launches into a description of that relationship in terms of "a good farmer" who tills, cultivates, grafts, hoes, digs, waters, and prunes his seedling with the goal of planting lavishly. "He [Origen] did the sowing of the seeds at the right time, and all the rest of the cultivation at its right time, appropriately accomplishing each task and with reason's own means" (7.99). This was not without the occasional "lancing," as the ultimate goal for the journey of faith is migrating "toward the divine."[48]

Clearly, throughout the description of Gregory's association with Origen, the relationship between the two is not simply academic. Origen, in true Eastern fashion, "was also a spiritual guide to his pupils, a living model and exemplar, providing them not only with information but

---

[47] Slusser, *Life and Works,* 12; See also Slusser, "The Main Ethical Emphases in the Writings of Gregory Thaumaturgus," 357–62. That Valantasis sees this relationship taking on sexual overtones can be discounted (17). In that passage in which Gregory praises Origen for "thrusting into his soul a spark of love for the Logos" that "seed or principle of life," Slusser, *Life and Works,* muses: "Just how Origen, of all people, *could* have done what is thus suggested is beyond me" (9), intimating the drastic nature of Origen's forced celibacy.

[48] Valantasis, 21. Also Rice, *The Pastor as Spiritual Guide*: "Characteristics of persons offering spiritual direction would include their being more reflective, more patient with self and with God, more accepting of certain weaknesses in self and others, and more willing to make hard decisions based on faith" (65f.).

with an all-embracing personal relationship."[49] In Pauline fashion, "Origen coveted [in Gregory] such another Timothy for the Master's work," whose work is reflected in Gregory's own work, if by no other evidence than the liberal use of scriptural imagery in the *Address.*[50] That imagery, as already noted, comes to fruition as Gregory contemplates his separation from his teacher, casting that "expulsion" in light of Adam being cast out of Eden, the prodigal leaving home, and the Babylonian exile of the Jews from Jerusalem (15.184ff.).[51] Yet not without effect, as Gregory, himself a pastor, would bring "gifts of an unexpected nature" to those whom he would serve; no longer Theodore ("awakened"), but Gregory ("awakener").[52] That Gregory offers some insight into pastoral practice is all the more made sure, forming the basis for a few thoughts on spiritual direction in general, and more specifically, as it is related to the pastoral task.

CHAPTER THREE

SPIRITUAL DIRECTION

The Process Defined

The art of spiritual direction, particularly in the East (which Gregory represents), is a well-

---

[49] Hausherr, ix.

[50] Roberts and Donaldson, 5. Cf. 3.28, 4.36, 4.41–42, 6.85–92, 7.93–94, 7.96, 7.108, 15.173–74, 15.180, 16.185–91, 16.193–97, 16.199–202, 17.200–02. Trigg writes: "Gregory . . . represents Origen as a spiritual benefactor, artfully alludes to the Christian Scriptures, faithfully echoes Origen's teaching, and speaks of his own illumination by the Logos after having been brought up worshipping false gods. I suggest that the most plausible reason for the peculiarity of his style is that Gregory, who imitated his teacher in so many ways, was himself 'economizing. . . . He put into practice what he had learned, acting, like his teacher, as a steward of God's mysteries" (51f.). A bit more fancifully put: "It is delightful to trace the hand of God from generation to generation, as from father to son, interposing for the perpetuity of the faith. . . . So Origen begat Gregory, and so the Lord has provided for the spiritual generation of the Church's teachers, age after age, from the beginning. Truly, the Lord gave to Origen a holy seed, better than natural sons and daughters; as if, for his comfort, Isaiah had written, forbidding him to say, 'I am a dry tree'" (Roberts and Donaldson, 3).

[51] Gregory himself concludes: "I seem to be one of those who is expelled from a city and this sacred fatherland of mine, in which both by day and night the holy psalms and hymns and songs and mystic discourses are announced, and (in which there is) light by the sun and continuously, (where) by day we conversed with the divine mysteries on our own behalf, and at night possessed by mental presentation those things which by day the soul saw and managed, and to speak altogether briefly there the inspired possession was forever" (16.196).

[52] Fox, 519, who highlights other reflections on the "departures of bright young men."

documented and studied subject.[53] Scarred by the "'giving' of one's blood in asceticism and self-discipline," and at times even abused and misunderstood during the monastic period, spiritual direction has taken on a new and most refreshing meaning, made popular in the recent writings of authors such as Henri Nouwen and Eugene Peterson.[54] Broadly understood, spiritual direction is that "interpersonal process in which two people work together toward the goal of a deeper, more explicitly intimate and mutual relationship with God." It is the "help given by one Christian to another which enables that person to pay attention to God's personal communication to him or her, to respond to this personally communicating God, to grow in intimacy with this God, and to live out the consequences of the relationship." More concisely put, "it involves an experiential awareness of God's presence that leads to conversation, communion and ultimately authentic transformation of the entire person by an internal yielding to his will.[55]

Using this definition, it becomes immediately clear that this very description well characterizes the relationship shared between Origen and Gregory, where "the *focus* of this type of spiritual direction is on experience, not ideas, and specifically on religious experience, i.e., any experience of the mysterious Other whom we call God."[56] In many respects, that relationship seemed to involve a process of healing the soul and deepening one's relationship with God, or what the church has called the care or "cure of souls."[57] Communication and

---

[53] See particularly, Hausherr, Culbertson & Shippee, and more recently, Gregory F. Rogers, "Spiritual Direction in the Orthodox Tradition," *Spiritual Direction and the Care of Souls: A Guide to Christian Approaches and Practices,* eds. Gary W. Moon and David G. Benner (Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 2004), 31–54.

[54] Rogers, 34f. From Nouwen, see *The Wounded Healer: Ministry in Contemporary Society* (Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1972), *The Living Reminder* (New York: Harper and Row, no date given), and *In the Name of Jesus: Reflections on Christian Leadership* (New York: Crossroad, 1994). From Petersen, *The Contemplative Pastor: Returning to the Art of Spiritual Direction* (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 1989), *Working the Angles* (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 1987), 103–31, and *Five Smooth Stones for Pastoral Work* (Atlanta: John Knox Press, 1980).

[55] Barry and Connolly, *The Practice of Spiritual Direction,* 155, 8, 13.

[56] Ibid., 8.

[57] Though perhaps not quite to the extent that William Clebsh and C. R. Jaekel (*Pastoral Care in Historic*

(continued next page)

intimacy with God, however, were at the forefront, as witnessed in Gregory's time with his teacher.

That this spiritual formation takes place within the context of a sacramental life (Baptism, Eucharist, confession, and liturgy), characteristic of modern Orthodox spirituality, does not seem to be the case with Gregory and his tutor.[58] Yet these alone do not constitute the aim of spiritual direction, though they are clearly the vehicles for it. The true goal of the Christian life is to acquire the Holy Spirit of God, to enter into union with Him, taking the "substance of the . . . traditional material regarding the interior life" and attempting to integrate that material with the wider world.[59] That this was Origen's goal for his students is clear. Furthermore, that this process could not be hurried is evidenced by the fact that it took Gregory the better part of five years to lead others to the place that Origen had brought him. Single-handedly, this is evidence

---

Perspective, New York: Aronson, 1964) where the cure of souls is seen in terms of "overcoming some impairment or movement towards wholeness, with the emphasis on the whole person . . . acts designed to help hurting person endure and transcend a circumstance in which restoration or recuperation is either impossible or improbable . . . reconciling and reestablishing broken relationships . . . guiding . . . helping people make wise choices and thereby grow in spiritual maturity" (11f.). That some of these things occurred in Gregory's life as a result of his relationship with Origen cannot be questioned, but spiritual direction within a pastoral context does not necessarily include all of these components. From an Orthodox perspective, Rogers sees spiritual direction as focusing on "the healing of the soul, the restoration and fulfillment of the image and likeness of God in the human person. In the process the person grows into a relationship with God which is ultimately so intimate that it can only be described as *union*" (31).

[58] See Rogers, 32f. He correctly assumes that the first priority of the spiritual director or priest is that he "brings the sacraments and the teaching of the church into the experience of the Orthodox Christian" (32). In the Eastern tradition, this life involves prayer, reading Scripture, meditation, feasting and fasting, serving others, worship and sacraments, holy reading and Sabbath rest (see also Rice, 51–58). Also, a major source for readings on the spiritual life in Orthodoxy is the *Philocalia*, a vast collection of spiritual writings from various patristic sources. That this is a path that the spiritual director himself will take is also a given. In fact, "Orthodox spirituality knows no fundamental distinction between the monk and the layperson, at least in terms of the nature of the process of salvation. All are called to purification, illumination and ultimate union with God. All are called to be transformed, to acquire the Holy Spirit, to become partakers of the divine nature. All are called to pray. The station of life may be different, the challenges may be different, but the goal is the same: the healing of the soul and the restoration and fulfillment of the image of God in the human being" (42).

[59] Valantasis, 3. "The whole focus (in spiritual direction) is upon God's presence in that person's life. In spiritual direction, the Holy Spirit consciously becomes a third party" (Rice, 68). The whole goal and context is faith in what God has done, what He is, even now, doing! The "process" by which a formation in faith takes place, finding its corollaries in Gregory's five year life with Origen, is described nicely by both Rogers, 40ff., and Moon and Benner, 19f. Purification, illumination and union are the steps, with spiritual formation's ultimate results centering in "1. The directee begins to awaken to her true identity and, with God's grace, dethrones the false self. 2. Conversation and communion with God increase and deepen into a sense of spiritual union. 3. The various

(continued next page)

enough for pastorates that take into consideration that spiritual "Romes" are not built in a day, but can be cultivated only by a methodical and well-integrated ministry that is not afraid to delve into the deeper things of the lives of those entrusted to a pastor's care—not the least of which are the very souls of the people of God.[60]

The Teacher–Student Relationship

Clearly, one of the key components in the formation of a Christian is the teacher–student relationship. In fact, one may well argue that the whole process of spiritual formation is centered on the teacher and his ability to relate intimate spiritual truths in life-changing and pragmatic ways to those under his care. Richard Valantasis, Richard Longnecker, and Robert Wilken all do a more than adequate job in spelling out this relationship in general terms.[61] What is clear from each of these sources, and from Gregory's own words regarding Origen, is that what is crucial to the teacher–student relationship is that the association be characterized by a spirit of trust and clear direction (as seen in Origen's "program") as well as a deeply rooted friendship. The Graduate Program in the Art of Spiritual Direction at San Francisco Theological Seminary

---

dimensions of the person become united by the presence and love of the indwelling Christ" (Moon and Benner, 20).

[60] A thought that is not wasted on either Gregory (7.99), or Peterson, who in true Gregorian fashion, writes: "The person . . . who looks for quick results in the seed planting of well-doing will be disappointed. If I want potatoes for dinner tomorrow, it will do me little good to go out and plant potatoes in my garden tonight. There are long stretches of darkness and invisibility and silence that separate planting and reaping. During the stretches of waiting there is cultivating and weeding and nurturing and planting still other seeds" (2, commenting on a poem entitled *Traveling Light,* by Wendell Barry). . . . "The pastor's question is, 'Who are these particular people, and how can I be with them in such a way that they can become what God is making them?' My joy is simply to be there, teaching, preaching Scripture as well as I can, and being honest with them, not doing anything to interfere with what the Spirit is shaping in them. Could God be doing something that I never even thought of? Am I willing to be quiet for a day, a week, a year? Like Wendell Berry, am I willing to spend fifty years reclaiming this land? With these people?" (*The Contemplative Pastor,"* 4) "The search is for life in God's kingdom; hurry is the devil" (Moon and Benner, 12). What is central "is to recognize human uniqueness and thus to respect and value each person's particular pilgrimage. . . . Central to spiritual guidance is the hard work of attending reverently to the way in which each person has come to terms with God's call and how each has experienced and responded to that call" (Rice, 42f.).

[61] See Valantasis above; also, Richard N. Longnecker, *Patterns of Discipleship in the New Testament* (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 1996); Robert L. Wilken, "Alexandria: a School for Training in Virtue," *Schools of Thought in the Christian Tradition* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1984), 15–30.

defines spiritual direction in precisely this way: "A covenant friendship between Christians in which one assists the other in the discernment of God's presence and the contemplative living out of God's call."[62]

Gregory describes his relationship to Origen in this way, but also as so much more, painting that relationship in terms that are perhaps as exaggerated as Nyssa's of the Wonderworker's life. Specifically, the basis of his connection to Origen is seen in terms of "binding," in which the teacher uses every means such as discourse, everything of beauty, and all of his powers, to "bind us close" (6.74). Each of these is employed to praise the philosophical life and to condemn ignorance (6.75f.), accomplished by a mixture of "winsome grace with persuasiveness and compelling force" (6.78), and leading to "conversion." Gregory writes, "We were pierced as by a dart by his discourse—even from the first" (6.78), as he was drawn to his teacher by some compulsion greater than his words (6.78). Friendship was a key (6.81), and as noted above, this bonding was salvific, whereby

> being gravely wounded by it, I was persuaded to neglect all the affairs or studies for which we seemed destined, including even my precious law, and my native land and friends, those back home and those we were to visit. Just one thing seemed dear and beloved to me, the life of philosophy and this divine human being, its chief exponent (6.84).[63]

Whether or not Origen also derived some benefit from this relationship, Gregory does not say. But it seems that a "binding" or friendship of this magnitude could not but bring blessing to Origen himself, even though the authority by which he goes about his task is clear, an authority

---

[62] Rice, 63. St. John Climacus, in his *Ladder of Divine Ascent,* puts it this way: "A genuine teacher is he who has received from God the tablet of spiritual knowledge, inscribed by His Divine finger, that is by the in working of illumination, and who has no need of other books. It is as unseemly for teachers to give instruction from notes taken from other men's writings, as it is for painters to take inspiration from other men's compositions" (see Rogers, 36).

[63] Rice, commenting on Gregory as being "twice-born" notes that Gregory's pilgrimage was "marked by a moment of insight, a dramatic turn, a time of clarity and assurance—a day they remember all their lives. . . . The rest of their days they seek to explore the meaning of that experience of clarity when faith seemed completely obvious" (44).

that Gregory readily accepts. "Brother, constantly call on God, that he may show you a man who is able to direct you well, one whom you ought to obey as though he were God Himself, whose instruction you must carry out without hesitation, even if what he enjoins on you appears to you to be repugnant and harmful," St. Symeon the New Theologian once wrote.[64] In biblical terms, as Moses was to Joshua, Elijah was to Elisha, Jesus was to the Apostles, or Paul was to Timothy, so also was Origen to Gregory, especially in terms of this authority and the way in which Gregory comes to accept the direction of his teacher. In the East, a spiritual director is "*geron* (*senior*, old man), *prebyteros* (elder), since he normally was advanced in years or at least older; as *didascalos*, since he had to teach; *diorthotes* (one who set right), *paideutes* (teacher), *aleiptes* (trainer) . . . *prostates* (leader), *epistates* (master) and *ephestos* (director)."[65] Origen is all of this to Gregory, as also a true shepherd to his lamb.

How important this relationship seems to be when pastors minister to what Henri Nouwen once called the "nuclear man."[66] Though somewhat dated, Nouwen offers a keen insight into what it means to be a pastor in the Lord's church, identifying a number of principles of Christian leadership, ones that Gregory would no doubt have seen and appreciated in his own "divine pedagogue." In fact, the parallels regarding spiritual direction, then and now, are striking. For instance, being an "articulator of inner events," a "possessor of compassion," as well as a "contemplative critic" are all qualities that Gregory identifies in Origen.[67] Add a personal

---

[64] As quoted in Rogers, 43.

[65] Hausherr, 4. He is a "father," and he is "spiritual." As "father" he is one who is "continually born a son of God in Jesus Christ." As "spiritual" . . . "The essential, indispensable, condition for becoming someone's spiritual father is to first be spiritual oneself" (29). For the spiritual father "the *pneuma* is essentially active: it is acquired through practice (*praxis*). One perceives its presence through its operations. Through it, above all, one becomes 'diacritical', that is, able to discern the spirits. This is essential" (36; cf. Origen, *In Num. hom.* 271.11).

[66] Nouwen, *The Wounded Healer.*

[67] Nouwen, 37–45. "The first and most basic task required of the minister of tomorrow therefore is to clarify the immense confusion which can arise when people enter this new internal world. . . . In this context pastoral conversation is not merely a skillful use of conversational techniques to manipulate people into the Kingdom of

(continued next page)

concern for the one under a director's care, faith in the value and meaning of life, as well as an ever-present search for signs of hope and promise, and we have a most well-rounded teacher, and again, a portrait of Origen as Gregory describes him.[68] Nouwen, akin to Gregory's Origen, concludes:

> A Christian leader is not a leader because he announces a new idea and tries to convince others of its worth; he is a leader because he faces the world with eyes full of expectation, with the expertise to take away the veil that covers its hidden potential. Christian leadership is called ministry precisely to express that in the service of others new life can be brought about.[69]

The means by which a teacher or pastor may do this are legion, depending on each particular pastor's *charism* and life experiences. As "doctor . . . counselor . . . intercessor . . . mediator . . . sponsor . . . as one who has experienced God himself and who possesses the Holy Spirit," the spiritual teacher and pastor will pray and stand with, give counsel and direction to, the one entrusted to his care. He will do this with all the care of a Paul, or Origen, all in an effort to make sense of the various threads of our existence, recognizing the handiwork of God in it all.[70] However, that the goal is salvific, as it was recognized by Gregory, is to be exalted above all else. Whatever else the pastor may be, and whatever qualification of spiritual direction he may or may not possess, that he leads his sheep to Christ is paramount. Origen clearly led Gregory to this well-watered pasture. No doubt Gregory, in the shadow of his teacher, would lead others to this same sacred space. That Origen's method, as defined by Gregory's *Address,* serves, in part,

---

God, but a deep human encounter in which a man is willing to put his own faith and doubt, his own hope and despair, his own light and darkness at the disposal of others who want to find a way through their confusion and touch the solid core of life" (37, 39). This is a most contemporary evaluation, and one found in antiquity.

[68] Ibid., 72-76.

[69] Ibid., 75.

[70] Rogers, 43ff. Paul "feels a continuing responsibility for those whom he has 'begotten' or 'initiated' into the Christian life, a direct involvement in their subsequent struggles. . . . He does not simply preach the word to them, but he bears their burdens, making their joy and sorrows his own. . . . He helps his children in Christ precisely because he is willing to share himself with them, identifying his own life with theirs" (Hausherr, viiif.).

as a pattern for this type of ministry today only highlights the importance of the divine origins of the pastoral office in today's world, an office no less important today that it was in the third century.

Both Origen and Gregory fit the description of Nouwen with regards to the Christian leader as

> a man of hope whose strength in the final analysis is based neither on self–confidence derived from his personality, nor on specific expectations for the future, but on a promise given to him. This promise not only made Abraham travel to unknown territory; it not only inspired Moses to lead his people out of slavery; it is also the guiding motive for any Christian who keeps pointing to new life even in the face of corruption and death.[71]

What follows are a few concluding remarks, as pastors would seek to be the above to the ones God has placed under their care.

Conclusions

Richard Valantasis cautions that it always behooves historians to recognize the limits of their methods "in that these referents are historical constructions, conceptual models created by historians to impose meaning on events or people. Such has been the case with Gregory Thaumaturos's speech."[72] This means that it is always an awkward, and at times risky, business to try to establish a thesis and then seek some person or event in antiquity to establish as a norm. We are much more faithful to the historical task when we approach the study of the Fathers to see if their work has anything to offer on its own merit or inherently possesses some teachable point on its own. To the point of this paper, then, does the *Address* of Gregory the

---

[71] *The Wounded Healer,* 76. Summarizing various authors on the qualifications: a Christian leader is one who is (1) committed to the journey of transformation, including their own pilgrimage, (2) a good and kind listener, (3) dedicated to helping another to recognize and follow the inspiration of grace in his or her life, (4) one moved by the mystery of God's transforming love, and (5) one discovered by the community of believers—rather than self-proclaimed—because of the unworldly manner in which they lead their life." (Moon and Benner, 21). See also David G. Benner, *Sacred Companions: The Gift of Spiritual Friendship and Direction* (Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 2002), Barry and Connolly, *The Practice of Spiritual Direction* (New York: Seabury, 1982), Thomas Merton, *Spiritual Direction and Meditation* (Collegeville: Liturgical Press 1960), and Carolyn Gratton, *The Art of Spiritual Guidance* (New York: Crossroad, 2000).

[72] *Spiritual Guides of the Third Century,* 13f.

Wonderworker in any way address the subject of the spiritual direction in general, and pastoral ministry more specifically?

If the assessment is true, that there is renewed interest in spiritual direction, as evidenced by authors such as Nouwen, Peterson, and most recently Moon and Benner, then the answer is a resounding "yes!" For any talk about the nature and objectives of spiritual direction today would not be complete without an adequate historical treatment of the way it and the pastoral task have been practiced in the past. Furthermore, if observations such as that of Rice are true—when it comes to spirituality, there is an intense distrust of most that passes for organized religion—then once again, a more *individualized* approach to pastoral ministry seems all the more necessary in communicating the deep mysteries of the faith to a particularly postmodern generation.[73]

Gregory's *Address* offers some helpful insights in how this method might work, especially when a pastor enters into a caring relationship with those who are "not yet of the fold." This "fullest contemporary account of Origen's teaching methods"[74] is of immense help, if for no other reason than its service as a primary-source document for pastoral theology as it was practiced by those who shaped the church's expression of faith and witness. If there are limitations to using the *Address* in this way, they are mostly culturally conditioned. The practice set forth in the *Address* is still sound, and offers a renewed affirmation for those who still see pastoral ministry in these kinds of terms.

However, there is a glaring limitation: there are no special qualities inherent in the teacher himself, as Gregory borders on demonstrating at times, but more in the word and the Savior he

---

[73] *The Pastor as Spiritual Guide,* 42. Specifically, he writes: "Some of the people most concerned about pursuing a relationship with God have left organized religion because they have sensed that churches, despite all their language, have no real spiritual depth. They have joined the host of those who believe without belonging, who see the structures of institutional religion as impediments to their spiritual pilgrimage. They cannot imagine that concern about the details of carpet color, budget distribution, struggles for power among various groups, or conflicts about the frequency of Communion are necessary for their spiritual lives. . . . The religious expression remains personal and individual; institutions, particularly those of organized religion, generate anxiety" (40ff.).

represents and proclaims. In the end, the pastor and teacher is in no way a savior, as any benefit to the student must be attributed to the Holy Spirit who works through His appointed means. That "the human relationship mediates the divine realm"[75] occurs only insofar as God is still very much active through His means. To use Paul's metaphor, we are but "jars of clay, to show that this all-surpassing power is from God, and not from us" (II Cor. 4:7). The *Address* is a good place to begin to learn what it means to be that sort of vessel. This occurs not only in the way Origen is portrayed to have taken to the task appointed him for a time, but also in the fact that Gregory identifies the hand of God in the process every step of the way. There is never a time when he fails to recognize the leading by his "angel," guides that still serve as "winds, ministers, and flames of fire" (Heb. 1:7), and in ways known only to wisdom personified in Jesus.

For in the end, what is pastoral ministry? As Peterson suggests, it is the ancient art of the *cure of souls*, a ministry that will be intensely personal and highly individualized. Speaking specifically to that task, he writes:

> It should be clear that the cure of souls is not a specialized form of ministry . . . but is the essential pastoral work. It is not a narrowing of pastoral work to its devotional aspects, but it is a way of life that sues weekday tasks, encounters, and situations as the raw material for teaching prayer, developing faith, and preparing for a good death. Curing souls is a term that filters out what is introduced by a secularizing culture. It is also a term that identifies us with our ancestors and colleagues in ministry, lay and clerical, who are convinced that a life of prayer is the connective tissue between holy day proclamation and weekday discipleship.[76]

---

[74] Slusser, *Life and Works* 19.

[75] Valantasis, 31.

[76] Petersen, *The Contemplative Pastor,* 59. On what a people of God might say to us as Pastors as to what they expect of us, while not pertinent to this paper is worth the quote: "We need help in keeping our beliefs sharp and accurate and intact. We don't trust ourselves, our emotions seduce us into infidelities. We know we are launched on a difficult and dangerous act of faith, and there are strong influences intent on diluting or destroying it. We want you to give us help. Be our pastor, a minister of Word and sacrament in the middle of this world's life. Minister with Word and sacrament in all the different parts and stages of our lives—in our work and play, with our children and our parents, at birth and death, in our celebrations and sorrows, on those days when morning breaks over us in a wash of sunshine, and those other days that are all drizzle. This isn't the only task in the life of faith, but it is your task. We will find someone else to do the other important and essential tasks. This is *yours*: Word and sacrament (138).

(continued next page)

Which is not to suggest that there are not generalities when dealing with the sinfulness of humanity, or with the need for all humanity to embrace a greater righteousness. But leaving the ninety-nine for the sake of the one seems a lost and dying concern as we pastors are tempted to pursue the biggest bang for our spiritual buck.[77] It seems that, given the spiritual climate of today, a more personalized and individualized ministry and witness would be beneficial in addressing the vast confusion that people see in the religious landscape before them. That people are just as much slaves to Adam and Eve's sin of "being as gods" demonstrates all the more that they need someone to take the time to walk with them "in the cool of the day," a teacher, or the Teacher, to lead them to Him.[78]

Gregory gives us a model, a model perhaps summarized by the above ancient pastoral prayer, which when translated reads: "Come, Holy Spirit, shepherd him who is to shepherd others; guide him who is to guide others; discover to him [the Scriptures] who is to discover them to others; give to him who is to give to others, Lord Christ, have mercy upon us!"[79] While Gregory's *Address* does not necessarily spell out in complete detail how this relationship of pastor to his sheep is to be carried out (and how many pastors are expected to be proficient in geometry, the natural sciences, rhetoric, and logic), it harkens back to another time when true pastoral ministry

---

[77] Nouwen writes, "Personal concern means making (another) the only one who counts, the one for whom I am willing to forget my many other obligations, my scheduled appointments and long-prepared meetings, not because they are not important but because they lose their urgency in the face of (another's) agony. Personal concern makes it possible to experience that the going after the 'lost sheep' is really a service to those who were left alone" (*The Wounded Healer,* 73).

[78] Climacus' warning is most contemporary: "Those of us who wish to get away from Egypt, to escape from Pharaoh, need some Moses to be our intermediary with God, to stand between action and contemplation, and stretch out his arm to God, that those led by him may cross the sea of sin and put to flight the Amalek of the passions. Those who have given themselves up to God but imagine that they can go forward without a leader are surely deceiving themselves" (*Ladder of Divine Ascents,* as quoted in Rogers, 44). Cf. Kallistos Ware, "The Spiritual Father in Saint John Climacus and Saint Simeon the new theologian," *Spiritual Direction in the Early Christian East,* ed. Irenee Hausherr (Kalamazoo: Cistercian, 1990), vii–xxxiii.

[79] Quoted in *Minister's Prayer Book: An Order of Prayers and Readings,* ed. John W. Doberstein (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1986), 13f.

was, shall we say, pastoral. Commenting on Gregory's legacy to the church, Nyssa was confident to say of his mentor:

> He was filled with a certain boldness and confidence through that vision, like an athlete who, since he has enough experience from competition and strength from training, strips confidently for the race and prepares for combat against his competitors; now he likewise, suitably anointed in soul by his care for himself and by the assistance of the favor which was revealed to him, thus undertook his struggles—for his whole life in the priesthood deserves to be called nothing less than struggles or contests in which through faith he combated every power of the Adversary.[80]

This contending for the faith still goes on, one sheep at a time.

[80] *Life,* 4.33.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Crouzel, Henri. "La Cristologia in Gregorio Taumaturgo." *Gregorianum* 61 (1980): 745–55.

____. *Origen.* Translated by A. S. Worrall. Edinburgh: T. and T. Clark, 1989.

Culbertson, Philip L. and Shippee Arthur Bradford, ed. *The Pastor: Readings from the Patristic Period.* Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1990.

Eusebius. *The Church History: a New Translation with Commentary.* Translated by Paul Maier. Grand Rapids: Kregel Publishers, 1999.

Fox, Robin Lane. *Pagans and Christians in the Mediterranean World from the Second Century A.D. to the Conversion of Constantine.* San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1988.

Gregory, Bishop of Nyssa. "On the Life and Wonders of Our Father Among the Saints, Gregory the Wonderworker." In *St. Gregory, Thaumaturgis: Life and Works*, translated by Michael Slusser, 41–87. The Fathers of the Church, vol. 98. Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 1998.

Gregoire Le Thaumaturge. *Remerciement a Origene suive de La Lettre D'Origene a Gregoire.* Sources Chretiennes, no. 148. Translated by Henri Crouzel. Paris: Les Editions du Cerf, 1969.

Hausherr, Irenee, SJ. *Spiritual Direction in the Early Christian East.* Kalamazoo: Cistercian Publications, 1990.

Jarick, John. *Gregory Thaumaturgos' Paraphrase of Ecclesiastes.* Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1990.

Longnecker, Richard N. *Patterns of Discipleship in the New Testament.* Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 1996.

MacMullen, Ramsey. *Christianizing the Roman Empire (A.D. 100–400).* New Haven: Yale University Press, 1984.

Mateo-Seco, Lucas F. "El cristiano ante la vida y ante la morte: Estudio del Panegirico de Gregorio de Nisa sobre Gregorio Taumaturgo." In *The Bibliographical Words of Gregory of Nyssa,* edited by Andreas Spira, 197–219. Philadelphia: Philadelphia Patristics Foundation, 1984.

Metcalfe, Marotta, and William Charles Metcalfe. *Gregory Thaumaturgus. Address to Origen.* London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1920.

Mitchell, Stephen. "The Life and *Lives* of Gregory Thaumaturgus." In *Portraits of Spiritual Authority: Religious Power in Early Christianity, Byzantium and the Christian Orient,*

edited by Jan Willem Drijvers and John W. Watt, 99–138. Leiden: Brill, 1999.

Moon, Gary W. and David G. Benner. "Spiritual Direction and Christian Soul Care." In *Spiritual Direction and the Care of Souls: A Guide to Christian Approaches and Practices,* edited by Gary W. Moon and David G. Benner, 7–28. Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 2004.

Noakes, Kenneth W. "The Metaphrase on Ecclesiastes of Gregory Thaumaturgus." In *Studia Patristica,* edited by Elizabeth Livingstone, 194–97. Vol. 15.1. Leuven: Peeters, 1984.

Nouwen, Henri J. M. *The Wounded Healer: Ministry in Contemporary Society.* Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1972.

Petersen, Eugene. *The Contemplative Pastor: Returning to the Art of Spiritual Direction.* Grand Rapids: William. B. Eerdmans, 1989.

Quasten, Johannes. *Patrology.* vol. 2. Allen, Tex.: Christian Classics, no date given.

Rice, Howard. *The Pastor as Spiritual Guide.* Nashville: Upper Room Books, 1998.

Rogers, F. Gregory. "Spiritual Direction in the Orthodox Tradition." In *Spiritual Direction and the Care of Souls: A Guide to Christian Approaches and Practices,* edited by Gary W. Moon and David G. Benner, 31–54. Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 2004.

Schaff, Philip. *History of the Christian Church.* vol. 2. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 1965.

Slusser, Michael. "The Main Ethical Emphases in the Writings of Gregory Thaumaturgus." In *Studia Patristica*, edited by Elizabeth A. Livingstone, 357–62. Vol. 31. Leuven: Peeters, 1997.

____. "The 'To Philagrius on Consubstantiality' of Gregory Thaumaturgus." In *Studia Patristica*, edited by Elizabeth A. Livingstone, 230–35. Vol. 19. Leuven: Peeters, 1989.

Telfer, William. "The Cultus of St. Gregory Thaumaturgus." *Harvard Theological Review* 29 (1936): 225–344.

____. "The Latin Life of St. Gregory Thaumaturgus," *Journal of Theological Studies* 31 (1930): 142–55,354–63.

Thaumaturgus, St. Gregory. *Remerciement a Origene, suivi de la Lettre d'Origene a Gregoire.* Sources Chretiennes, vol. 148. Edited and Translated by Henri Crouzel. Paris: Cerf, 1969.

____. *Ante-Nicene Fathers*. ol. 6. Edited by Rev. Alexander Roberts and James Donaldson. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, Repr. 1987.

____. *Life and Works*. The Fathers of the Church, vol. 98. Translated by Michael Slusser. Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 1998.

Thompson, Robert W. *The Teaching of St. Gregory: An Early Armenian Catechism.* Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1970.

Trigg, Joseph. "God's Marvelous *Oikonomia*: Reflections of Origen's Understanding of Divine and Human Pedagogy in the Address Ascribed to Gregory." *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 9 (Spring 2001): 27–52.

Valantasis, Richard. *Spiritual Guides of the Third Century.* Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991.

Van Dam, Raymond. "Hagiography and History: The Life of Gregory Thaumaturgus." *Classical Antiquity* 1 (1982): 272–308.

Van Esbroeck, Michel. "The *Credo* of Gregory the Wonderworker and Its Influence through Three Centuries." In *Studia Patristica*, edited by Elizabeth A. Livingstone, 255–66. Vol. 19. Leuven: Peeters, 1989.

Wilken, Robert L. "Alexandria: A School for Training in Virtue." In *Schools of Thought in the Christian Tradition*, 15–30. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1984.

Wolfram, Herwig. *History of the Goths.* Translated by Thomas J. Dunlap. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988.